

## 2018-19 Automotive Technology Comprehensive Program Review

### I.A. Program Purpose

Describe the purpose of the program and how it contributes to the mission of Skyline College.

#### Narrative

Automotive Mission Statement:

An Automotive Technology program that inspires and guides all students toward rewarding technical careers in the transportation service industry.

Goals:

1. To provide three levels of technical training as guided by our advisory board and community employers:
  1. Entry maintenance level
  2. Comprehensive Career Track Program
  3. In-Service training
2. Play a central role in the preparation of a future workforce and to expand networks and partnerships with the local business community, Audi of America, Subaru University, Nissan/Infinity (NTTA/ITTA), Ford ACE, and the Joint Apprenticeship Council;
3. Enhance the student's ability to perform analytical and technical analysis, service and repair of transportation systems.
4. Provide AS degree guidance and encourage transfer.

We believe this compliments the college's Mission Statement: "To empower and transform a global community of learners".

**I.B. Program Student Learning Outcomes**

List the current program student learning outcomes (PSLOs).

**Narrative**

1. ASE Exams: Successfully pas a minimum of 3 Automotive Service Excellence (ASE) exams.
2. Application: Apply theories, principles, and concepts to address skills learned that would apply to the NATEF Certified areas of the Automotive Technology Program.
3. Communication: Exhibit strong and effective written and oral communication skills.
4. Diagnostics Skills: Exhibit strong electrical and mechanical analytical diagnostic skills.
5. P-1 NATEF: Successfully complete 100% of P-1 NATEF specific tasks.
6. P-2 NATEF: Successfully complete 80% of the P-2 NATEF specific tasks.
7. P-3 NATEF: Successfully complete 50% of the P-3 NATEF specific tasks.

**I.C. Profile: Program Review Team**

Comprehensive program review is intended to be a collaborative process which promotes dialogue and reflection. Please identify all individuals who contributed to or shaped the program review narrative. Include names and the title or role of each person.

**Narrative**

Thomas G Broxholm  
Professor/Coordinator

Ruben Parra  
Professor

Julia Johnson  
Professor

Dan Ming  
Professor

Filipp Gleyzer  
Professor

Ed Yee  
Professor

Nancy Lam  
Staff Assistant

Krista Allen  
Automotive Technician

## II.A. Program Effectiveness

Review data related to the program and assess the program's effectiveness at meeting its described purpose. Consider using college-wide data for comparison purposes.

Program data may

- Standard program review reports from PRIE including indicators of success, retention, and equity
- Program-specific data such as labor market data, surveys, and custom reports
- Program Student Learning Outcome (PSLO) reports from TracDat
- Prior CPR/APPs
- Feedback from the program's administrator, advisory committees, and/or other stakeholders
- Course outlines of record and offering history (instructional programs only)
- Professional development received
- Other relevant data
- Additional data may be requested from PRIE by completing the Research Request Form available at <http://www.skylinecollege.edu/prie/request.php>

Based on the data reviewed, describe the overall effectiveness of the program and any conclusions drawn from the data

### Narrative

Based on our analysis of current data and feedback from our students, the advisory board, and community of employers the Automotive Program is overwhelmingly successful and effective. We do have improvements that need to be addressed but overall the statements and attached data will support the effectiveness of the Automotive program.

In August of 2017 the Skyline College Automotive Program was awarded 2 of 3 CTE STARS from the state Chancellor's Office for workforce development. The first star was for 100% employment and the second was for earning a living wage in the bay area. 71% of our students reported that they are earning a living wage in the bay area. Skyline College Automotive Program is the only Automotive Program in the State of California to earn 2 CTE Stars. Attachment: (Auto-2019-Strong-Workforce-Stars-eShowcase.pdf, Auto-2019- CTE-Stars Memo-2017.pdf)

Automotive has a 5 year student retention of 96% and a 5 year success rate of 87.4% according to the State Chancellor's Data Mart statistics downloaded on 2/24/19.

Attachment: (Auto-2019-Success-Retention-DataMart\_2-24-19.xlsx, Auto-2019-Top-5-Colleges-for-Completion.pdf)

Enrollment in our daytime career track program has risen over the past 4 semesters from being 78% full to being 94.4% full. Load has also risen from 430 to 487.

Attachments: (Automotive-2019-Program-Growth.pdf, Auto-2019-Load-FTES\_Fall\_17-Sp\_19.pdf)

Skyline College Automotive program awards over 7.9 times more State of California Certificates of Achievement (18-30 units) as compared to the average of all 44 community college Automotive programs in California that offer Certificates of Achievement in the 18-30 unit range. Attachments: (Auto-2019-Average Number of AS

Degrees & Certs in Automotive per Year from 2013-2018.pdf, Auto-2019-State Wide Program Awards & Degree Data by District Analyzed.xlsx)

Skyline College Automotive program compared Automotive AS degree completions for all 55 community colleges that offers an AS degree in Automotive Technology throughout the entire State of California. The data shows that we produce slightly more than the average yearly AS degrees awarded as all of the other Automotive programs that offer an AS degree in Automotive Technology. Attachments: (Auto-2019-Average Number of AS Degrees & Certs in Automotive per Year from 2013-2018.pdf, Auto-2019-State Wide Program Awards & Degree Data by District Analyzed.xlsx)

Skyline College Automotive program maintains an average of 312.76 FTES per year as compared to an average 154.67 FTES for all community college automotive programs in California. Attachments: (Auto-2019-Average Number of FTES in Automotive Technology.pdf, Auto-2019-FTES Summary by District.xlsx)

Low overall enrollment numbers are primarily due to lower enrollment in our evening classes which have been hit hard by repeatability restrictions. We are now offering about 30% fewer evening sections and we have seen our load and head count per class rise. Attachments: (Auto-2019-Enrollment-Sections.pdf)

Funding for outreach was not approved in last year's APP objective 397. Additionally, Auto has grant funds available for outreach that have repeatedly been denied & delayed when requested. Attachments:(AUTO-APP-2018 Denied Outreach support.pdf, Auto-2019-Outreach communication with Dean.pdf)

### **Evidentiary Documents**

[Auto-2019-Average Number of AS Degrees & Certs In Automotive per Year from 2013-2018.pdf](#)

[Auto-2019-Average Number of FTES in Automotive Technology.pdf](#)

[Auto-2019-Enrollment-Sections.pdf](#)

[Auto-2019-FTES Summary by District.xlsx](#)

[AUTO-2019-Load-FTES\\_Fall\\_17-Sp\\_19.pdf](#)

[Auto-2019-Outreach communication with Dean.pdf](#)

[Auto-2019-State Wide Program Awards & Degree Data by District Analyzed.xlsx](#)

[Auto-2019-Strong-Workforce-Stars-eShowcase.pdf](#)

[Auto-2019-Success-Retention-DataMart\\_2-24-19.xlsx](#)

[Auto-2019-Top-5-Colleges-for-Completion.pdf](#)

[AUTO-APP-2018 Denied Outreach support.pdf](#)

[Automotive-2019-Program-Growth.pdf](#)

## II.A.1 **Progress on Prior Program Objectives (Goals)**

Describe the progress made on prior CPR/APP objectives including identification of achievements or areas in which further effort is needed. If the program is new with no prior CPR/APP, comment on new program implementation.

Below the narrative box, use the Associate Objectives feature to select the related objectives. Once associated, you may also view each objective. If appropriate, edit the status to Completed or Discontinued.

### **Narrative**

#### **2018 APP Objective 396 (Advisory Board Course Objectives and Curriculum Review)**

Item 1.

This objective is an ongoing objective and over the course of several advisory board meetings we have been able to review the National Automotive Technicians Education Foundation (NATEF) tasks for three ASE subject areas. We still have 5 more to cover.

Item 2.

During our spring 2019 advisory board meeting we had over 25 industry partners and professionals who attended and discussed the future of the automotive program, the 15-unit course structure and the impact on the program if the two retiring instructors were not replaced.

Unanimously the industry partners board members overwhelmingly express 100% support for the program to maintain its current 15-unit course structure. Furthermore they found no evidence that breaking up the 15-unit course structure had any benefit for the students or for the employment community. In fact several concerns were discussed on how such a change could or would create a negative impact on the students quality of education and the quality of entry level employees the employer would receive.

When the discussion turned to the need to replace the two retiring automotive professors for the fall 2019 school year there was once again 100% support in favor of rehiring replacement professors. If these professors are not replaced the automotive program may need to reduce the 15-unit course offerings by two courses. This would reduce the number of students the automotive program can accept and educate every year ultimately reducing the number of entry level technicians that would be available for employment.

#### **2018 APP Objective 397 (Enrollment Outreach)**

This objective was designed to increase enrollment through personal outreach which needed to be funded. This objective was Rejected.

The denial of funding and support for personal outreach to local automotive businesses is directly tied to low enrollment, low load and the reduction of sections offered in our evening in-service classes.

2018 APP Objective 398 (Professional Development)

This is an ongoing objective that each instructor takes on a personal commitment to maintain a minimum of 20 hours of automotive technical training a year to meet our NATEF certification standards.

As of this report each instructor has completed or is currently working on the completion of 20 hours of automotive technical training for the 2018-2019 fiscal year. Attachment: (Auto-2019-NATEF-Training-Hours.pdf)

### **2018 APP Objective 424 (Student Evaluation)**

We have implemented the ASE student certificate and testing program. XX students have taken XX test since we started to offer the program in XX date. Out of every test taken, XX students have passed the chosen certification test(s).

We are still facing challenges with Admissions and Records (A&R) processing automotive student Certificates of Achievement. At our best estimate 30% of our students indicate that they have not received their certificate 9 – 12 months past submitting a request. When we question the student if they have moved in the past 12 months all of them indicate that they have not move in the past 24 – 60 months. Fall of 2018 and spring of 2019 automotive students were unable to use the new electronic application because the Information Technology (IT) department has locked them out of submitting an application without a counselor code. During the fall 2018 semester we asked A&R to fix this and they requested IT to fix this. As of 3/3/2019 this still has not been fixed.

Certificates issued on time has been a problem for over 10 years when we used paper forms so there is a history of students not receiving certificates. We don't know if the certificates were submitted to the State of California and the student never received the certificate, or, if the certificates were never submitted to the State of California and our program was not properly credited for all of our Certificates of Achievement.

Auto has submitted several time a list of all students who have not received current and past certificates. We are told A&R is working on it but students continue to complain to the Automotive Department and staff that they never received their certificate from the State of California.

We would like to see an annual report that clearly states which certificates were issued to each student who applied. We would also like to see a report that included any rejected certificates. Both reports should include the name, address, certificate name, and issuing date. Reports with due dates and critical information would help with accountability and accuracy.

### **2018 APP Objective 637 (Update Facilities)**

Building 10

Wall holes have been patched and painted, however all of the rooms need a fresh coat of paint and not patch paint. The request to have a dark color halfway up has not been done.

Building 8

We requested that the entire shop floor be reconditioned due to the condition and the age. It has been over 11 years since the floor was reconditioned. During the

reconditioning safety lines would be painted onto the floor in the proper location. The floor reconditioning was denied but we did get safety lines painted on the floor.

### **2018 APP Objective 638 (Classroom Learning Environment)**

We have requested new furniture for Building 10 Rooms 003 and 004. We have been told that the expense and objective has been approved by the VPI but the purchase and process has stalled. I have no idea if or when we will receive the requested furniture for these classrooms. I had hopes that we would receive the new furniture over the 2018-2019 winter break but that never happened. This objective appears to be in limbo.

### **2018 APP Objective 641 (Upgrade Media Learning Technology in Buildings 9 and 10.)**

Both Buildings 9 and 10 need smart classroom technology with pole drops and media wiring infrastructure. Additionally new screens, required projectors, and one flat screen TV is required to make both buildings fully compliant with smart classroom technology. I have been waiting on a financial quote from Information Technology (IT) for almost a year. It seems they have been waiting on a contractor who has never provided a quote. I spoke to IT on 2/20/19 and I was instructed to ask our facilities manager John Doctor for an electrical media quote and we would employ facilities to do the work if it was approved. This objective is currently in limbo. On 3/3/19 an email was sent to John Doctor requesting a quote for electrical media infrastructure in Buildings 9 and 10. Since this request is very recent, I'm waiting for a response.

### **Evidentiary Documents**

[Auto-2019-NATEF-Training-Hours.pdf](#)

### **Associated Objectives**

[725-Advisory Board Course Objective & Curriculum Review](#)

[726-Classroom Learning Environment](#)

[727-Enrollment - Outreach](#)

[728-Professional Development](#)

[737-Student Certificates of Achievement](#)

[729-Update Facilities](#)

[730-Upgrade Media Learning Technology in Building 9 and 10](#)

## II.A.2 Progress on Program Student Learning Outcomes

Describe the progress made on PSLOs including achievements, gaps in learning, and/or areas in which further effort is needed.

Upload the TracDat report to the SPOL document repository in the Program Review folder for the current academic year (Program Uploads). Make sure the file name includes the program name or abbreviation (e.g., PRIE-TracDat 2017).

### **Narrative**

Most of our PSLO are tied directly to our student success and retention. With an average success rate of 87% and greater over, not just 5 years but 10 plus years, supports our program outcomes.

We have one program outcome that is more difficult to assess and that is the first PSLO that is related to students passing ASE testing. We plan to reword this PSLO to be more realistic and we also realize that we need to be more proactive in encouraging our students to seek out ASE testing.

PSLO which is designed to encourage students to become ASE certified has fallen short. 75% of the qualifying students did not take any ASE tests. 8% took 2 test and 17% took 3 or more tests. The goal is to have 40% of our qualified students to take and pass 3 or more tests.

The PSLO needs to be reworded to not require a minimum number of test and to include the student level ASE test.

Attachment: (Auto-2019-PSLO-4Column.pdf, Auto-2019-PSLO ASE testing.pdf)

### **Evidentiary Documents**

[Auto-2019-PSLO ASE testing.pdf](#)

[Auto-2019-PSLO-4Column.pdf](#)

### II.A.3.a Program Personnel

Describe the current staffing structure of the program and how it aligns with achieving the purpose of the program.

#### **Narrative**

##### **Full-Time**

We currently have six full-time professors who are all teaching the career track certificate and AS degree 15-unit program courses. One of the six professors specializes in all core courses for our Asian Automotive Technology degree program. Some of these full-time professors teach an overload section during evening hours.

Each instructor specializes in one and sometimes two Automotive Service Excellence (ASE) sections or automotive areas. For example: Brakes, Manual Drive Trains, Engine Repair, Electrical, etc. With six instructors each teaching a specialty area for an entire semester the students get the best possible instruction. The long classes provide the required lab time that enhances the mastery of each subject, making our students sought after by employers.

The simplicity of only six long immersion classes taught by a full-time instructor who is a specialist in their area is the core foundation for our success as noted in narrative II.A.

The Spring 2019 semester enrollment for these six career track classes is currently at 94% capacity. The Automotive Department and all of our students will be facing a crisis when the Fall 2019 semester begins. As of May 31, 2019, the Automotive Department will be losing two of these professors to retirement. President Stanback-Stroud will not authorize hiring replacement instructors and she refused to consider all the Automotive Program statistical data when making this decision. The Automotive Department was informed that the only way she would authorize replacing these two instructors was if we were willing to break up our 15-unit course program structure. No evidence was ever provided to support making such a major change to a very successful program. Since our program structure is so deeply rooted in our success and our advisory board advised against these changes, we have decided to keep our current program design. It is the belief of the professionals in the Automotive Department that such a change could devastate our very successful program. The Automotive department did not take this decision lightly and the primary focus for our decision was the quality of education for our students.

#### **How does this play into the “Program Personnel” question of this narrative?**

With two missing full-time instructors, the Automotive Program will most likely have to offer two less program classes each semester. Not only will some returning students have to be turned away but the program will not have any room to take in any new students for one or two semesters. There will be a wait list to enter into our program, program completion could be delayed for a majority of the students, FTES will decline, Certificates of Achievement will decline and the number of students in the program who are available for employment to our community will also decline.

**Part-Time**

We also employ six adjunct professors who teach various courses during the afternoon and evenings depending on course selection and demand. One of these adjunct professors is teaching under the dual enrollment program at Terra Nova High School. Two adjunct instructors who teach fundamentals classes for us are full-time employed within the local high school district and their classes at the high schools are also considered dual enrollment.

**Associated Objectives**

[739-Rehire replacements for retired instructors](#)

### II.A.3.b Personnel FTE

Provide the current FTE of each category of personnel.

- FT Faculty FTE:
- Adjunct Faculty FTE:
- Classified Staff FTE:
- Administrator FTE:

#### **Narrative**

Full-Time Faculty FTE: 6 FTE (In Fall 2019, we lose 2 F/T faculty dropping down to 4 FTE)

Adjunct Faculty FTE: 8.997 FTE

Classified Full-Time Staff = 3 FTE

Administrator FTE: 1

FT overload FTE (Fall 2018) = 2.97

FT overload FTE (Spring 2019) = .978

(Includes Tom Broxholm AUTO Coordinator .267 and Julia Johnson AUTO Evening Coordinator .053 -

Fall 2018 and Spring 2019)

PT faculty change from semester to semester and the classes offered also change.

In Fall 2018, PT FTE = 1.78

In Spring 2019, PT FTE = 1.24

#### II.A.4 Program Access

Describe matters of access relevant to your program such as offering patterns, service hours, F2F vs. DE offerings, availability of services to online students, on-campus vs. off-campus locations, unaddressed needs, and/or highly effective practices.

##### **Narrative**

The Automotive program does not currently offer Distance Education (DE) courses. We feel this type of Career Technical Education (CTE) for career minded young individuals is best taught in a Face to Face (F2F) learning environment. The need for extensive hands-on exercises is critical for student success and mastery.

##### **Highly Effective Practices:**

- The automotive classes we offer do take advantage of personally created online learning modules, factory learning modules from one of our factory sponsors, video online and offline and interactive Learning Management Systems (LMS) such as Canvas.
  - The use of custom video created by our staff is used for student instruction as they watch and learn on the exact same components that are in the video.
  - The use of a video camera to project small objects or a demonstration onto a big screen is common practice with all of the automotive instructors. This ensures that every student can see the demonstration as if they were in a one-on-one instruction lesson with the instructor.
  - Some instructors use online books and the LMS provided by the book publisher to enhance the learning experience. Some of these publishers offer text that can also be read to the students as compared to having them read the material. Some of the text is not only illustrated but also animated to enhance the mechanical and electrical understanding of the subject matter.
  - Feedback questions similar in style and content to Automotive Service Excellence (ASE) certification is always incorporated into all of our lessons.
  - All of our instructors are well versed in PowerPoint, Microsoft Word, and email. Some instructors can write code, create video and image content with various software tools that are incorporated in Adobe's Creative Suite.
  - We all use wireless screen projection from a laptop to display scan tool data demonstrations while in the laboratory.

##### **Program Offering Patterns:**

We offer a career track Automotive Technology AS degree and subject matter Certificate of Achievement classes:

- Four days a week from 8:00 until 1:00 pm.
- Four days a week from 1:30 pm. until 6:30 pm.

We offer Automotive Technician AS degree courses:

- Four nights a week from 6:00 pm. to 10:00 pm.

Additionally we offer core classes in Automotive Fundamentals:

- Four days a week from 1:30 pm. to 4:45

- Two days a week from 3:30 pm. to 6:30 pm.
- Two days a week from 6:30 pm. to 9:45 pm.

**Due to a reduction in personnel from the administration not replacing two retiring instructors, future semesters offerings will be:**

We offer a career track Automotive Technology AS degree and subject matter Certificate of Achievement classes:

- Four days a week from 8:00 until 1:00 pm.

We offer Automotive Technician.AS degree courses:

- Four nights a week from 6:00 pm. to 10:00 pm.

Additionally we offer core classes in Automotive Fundamentals:

- Two days a week from 1:30 pm. to 4:45
- Two days a week from 3:30 pm. to 6:30 pm.
- Two days a week from 6:30 pm. to 9:45 pm.

## II.A.5 Program Environment

Describe key factors and changes impacting the program such as college initiatives, industry needs, regulatory changes, state mandates, grant requirements, personnel changes, demand for classes/services, and other issues.

### **Narrative**

#### **College Initiatives:**

Automotive Technology has and maintains a very successful program for our students, community and our school district with outstanding statistics. Our program and its structure is one of the most successful in the State of California. Over the past year Automotive has been singled out by the administration to change our very successful program structure of offering large unit size classes. The president is leveraging the replacement of two retiring automotive professors in an effort to get us to change. When Automotive has asked for information and data to support the requested change none could be provided. We asked how the change would benefit the automotive education of our students and our employment community. No statistical data could be provided. We consulted our advisory board and overwhelmingly they voted that we need to keep our current program structure as is, noting the requested changes could and would most likely do harm to the program and the education of the students. Because we have resisted and have elected not to comply without evidence that our students would benefit we have been singled out. This has resulted in a tremendously contentious relationship between the Automotive staff and the Administration. Not only the President's office, but difficulty with Workforce Development, PR and our own Dean because of our reluctance to change our already very successful program. Furthermore we felt roadblocks were purposely put up to minimize our ability to use Automotive specific grant funds for marketing and outreach initiatives.

Replacement rehires for two retiring instructors were categorically denied unless we agreed to meet the President's demands. Loss of these two positions will result in closing the Asian Import program and delaying the offering of one of the career track course which will result in overcrowded classes, a backlog of enrollment, a decline in FTES, a decline in certificates and delaying program completion for all of the automotive students.

#### **Industry Needs:**

Industry needs greatly impact our program from the content we teach to the number and type of classes that we offer. We hold two advisory board meetings every year to ensure we are meeting the needs of our community. We have a strong advisory board of approximately 25 industry partners and professionals from our local community. We are currently experience and all-time high demand for our students to fill entry level positions at dealerships, mass merchandiser, municipalities, government, and independent repair facilities. Entry level wages for our students through our internship program have risen from \$10-12/hr. to \$18-22/hr. in the last 4 years. We typically get on an average 10-15 job postings every month.

We have entered into educational collaboration agreements and sponsorship from Audi of America, Nissan/Infinity Technical Training Academy, Subaru University and

Ford Motor Co. Automotive Career Exploration (ACE) program sponsored by Serramonte Ford. All of these agreements have been signed within the last two years. These manufacturers have experienced dwindling numbers of journeyman and high retirement rates just like the rest of the industry. This has been driving them to consider new and innovative ways to recruit and retain employees. Their goal is to excite and retain entry level technicians who graduate from our program by supporting quality Community College Automotive programs throughout the United States.

### **State Mandates:**

Since the implementation of course repeatability rules from the State Chancellor's office enrollment in our evening industry courses have declined steadily. Working technicians would often repeat a class every 2 – 3 years to update themselves on industry changes and to get a refresher. Because they can no longer do this enrollment has declined resulting in the cancellation of classes. When the word got out that classes are being canceled the problem snowballed. Students were fearful to enroll in a class for fear of disappointment that the class would be canceled. Before repeatability was restricted, we used to offer approximately 30 sections of evening classes every year. During the 18/19 fiscal year we offered 10 automotive evening section and we struggle to fill these to an acceptable enrollment level.

### **Grant Requirements:**

As mentioned earlier, we have a grant to develop and implement a marketing plan. However, approval for staff to do the actual recruiting has been withheld and development of materials was significantly delayed. The delays have stymied our efforts to improve enrollment especially in our evening classes where need it the most.

### **Future Changes That Will Impact the Program:**

Since the president has refused to replace our two retiring instructors based solely on our inability to make the changes she requested and not on our program success, the automotive department will be facing the need to absorb 44 – 48 full-time students from 2 courses that will not be offered in future semesters. Not only will our classes be at an unsafe enrollment level some of these students will have to be asked to delay their automotive education by a semester or maybe even two semesters. Additionally the automotive department will not be able to enroll any new students who wish to enter into an automotive career. The department will have to create a wait list and we will have to establish a priority system for enrollment. FTES, Certificates of Achievement and AS degrees will all decline. The only number to increase will be class load while the student who wants an automotive education and our automotive community suffers and pays the price for the decision not to replace these two retiring instructors.

### **Program Environment:**

Last year in our APP we incorporated Objectives 637 (Upgrade Facilities), 638 (Classroom Learning Environment) and 641 (Upgrade Media Learning Technology in Building 9 and 10). Out of all three objectives only objective 637 had partial completion. Some of the walls have been patched and painted when the entire room needed painting and the yellow safety lines have been added but truly the entire floor

needed to be refurbished. All of these objectives had to do with improving the learning environment that the students learn in and the professors teach in. All objectives were approved in last year's APP.

We are underutilizing available lab space. The parking lot between buildings 9 and 10 is used for outside lab but only when the weather is nice. An awning with lighting could be used to cover this parking lot and wind breaks could be placed in the slots of the chain link fence. This would provide a partially protected area from the elements so day and evening classes in building 10 could utilize this space for lab even when the weather is poor.

### **Associated Objectives**

[738-Expand Lab Space](#)

## II.A.6 Program Equity

Based on the data reviewed, highlight any progress and/or effective practices employed in the program to address identified student equity gaps and minimize disproportionate impact. Describe any pre-existing or anticipate program barriers in making progress. If you intend to request resources for objectives related to equity, explain any connections between barriers described and the support/resource(s) requested.

### **Narrative**

The Automotive Program has an extremely small equity gap. Success between ethnicities ranges 79% (African American and Latino) to 91% (Asian and White, non-Hispanic). Female and male success rates have been virtually identical for the last four years (the largest variation was 91% female and 94% male success rates in 2015).

However, we do have a substantial gap in enrollment levels between male and female students (10% female and 85% male, with 5% being unreported). Also, enrollment of Black, non-Hispanic and Pacific Islander students is below 5% in both categories.

The department won a large grant devoted to market research, marketing plan development and deployment from the Jaques M. Littlefield family foundation. The purpose of this grant is to investigate perceptions of "influencers" on career and education choices among high school and adult school students. The market research team developed a very detailed recruiting and retention plan, with specific focus on under-represented students.

We are working with our PR department to implement this plan now. Included in the plan are social media content, videos and written materials that can be printed or posted on various sites. We hope to close these gaps through specific representation of females, Pacific Islanders and Black, non-Hispanic students in our marketing collateral. We plan to conduct targeted recruiting visits in San Francisco and San Mateo counties - provided our funding is released and time-sheets are approved.

Attachment: (Auto-2019-Program\_Equity\_2013\_to\_2018.pdf)

### **Evidentiary Documents**

[Auto-2019-Program\\_Equity\\_2013\\_to\\_2018.pdf](#)

### III.A. Curriculum Review

There are four steps to program review of curriculum:

1. Request your program's Course Offering Report from PRIE. Based on that report, take action to bank, delete, and/or reactivate courses. PLEASE SEE THE CPR WEBSITE (DIRECTIONS AND FORMS) FOR DETAILED INSTRUCTIONS.  
<http://www.skylinecollege.edu/programreview/cpr.php>
2. Review and update all course outlines on CurricUNET. PLEASE SEE THE CPR WEBSITE (DIRECTIONS AND FORMS) FOR DETAILED INSTRUCTIONS.  
<http://www.skylinecollege.edu/programreview/cpr.php>
3. Complete the Course Outline and Prerequisite Checklist Table. Upload the file to the SPOL document repository in the Program Review folder for the current academic year (Program Uploads).
4. Verify and document the two-year cycle of curriculum offering to ensure that students have access to courses necessary to complete certificates, degrees, and transfer in a timely manner. Review the sequencing of prerequisites.

#### Narrative

At the start of CPR (Fall 2018) the Automotive Department had 95 courses on the books. As of 3/3/2019, the following progress has been made towards deletion, banking, new or updating all of the Automotive program courses.

#### Done:

18	Deleted
32	Banked
10	New courses
8	New cross listed courses
17	Updated
2	Certificates of Achievement added
7	Certificates of Achievement updated

#### To be completed:

8	Courses on the 3/20/2019 agenda for updating
8	Courses that are 90% updated in CurricUNET
4	Course that are cross listed and 90% updated inCurricUNET
11	Courses that still need to be banked
1	AS degrees need to be updated



Attachment: (Auto-2019-Course\_Modification\_Tracking.pdf)

**Evidentiary Documents**

[Auto-2019-Course\\_Modification\\_Tracking.xlsx](#)

#### IV.A.1 **Considering Key Findings**

Considering the results of CPR assessment, identify program strengths, challenges, opportunities, concerns, and areas in which further research is needed. Describe how the key findings can be used to improve program effectiveness in order to promote student learning and achievement.

##### **Narrative**

Our strengths lie in our program design - 15 unit classes taught by single subject expert, full-time faculty devoted to student success and endless hours of extra work put in by staff to create the best possible learning experience for our students.

Challenges currently include lack of administrative support and denial of two full-time replacement positions for our retiring instructors.

Another huge challenge lies in the online application for our automotive certificates. Information Technology (IT) difficulties prevent our students from applying online and have resulted in a huge backlog in issuing certificates for our department. Previously, certificates were simply not being completed in a timely manner by Admissions and Records. Recent changes in the certificate application process has made this problem even worse. Our best estimate is that 30% of our students never receive their certificates.

Technological challenges include lack of infrastructure for smart classrooms in Buildings 9 and 10. For example, Room 10-003 has a 100-ft network cable and a switch rather than the preferred network infrastructure connections for classroom computers.

Pole drops for projectors need to be installed in Building 10 and projectors need to be upgraded.

Multimedia electrical infrastructure for Building 10 projectors and pole drops need to be installed.

Opportunities include record high demand for our graduates and extremely high enrollment. If we were able to maintain our program design and number of classes, our graduates will have a great opportunity for success in their chosen field and the ability to earn a living wage.

However, if the two replacement positions are not approved, this will result in a reduction of the number of course sections offered. This will have an extremely negative impact on FTES, AS degrees, Certificates of Achievement, student completion, and on the employers in our community that we serve.

#### **IV.A.2 Aspirations**

The key findings and program aspirations will be used as the foundation to build a strategy for program enhancement.

- What is the ideal future of the program?
- What long-term results does the program want to achieve?
- How do the key findings prompt or inform the program's aspirations?

#### **Narrative**

##### **Ideal future:**

1. We will be allowed to hire replacement professors for our two retiring professors and allowed to return to six full-time instructors.
2. Full administration support: Dean, VPI and President that truly understands Automotive CTE programs and they listens when our advisors and the industry experts voice an opinion or concern.
3. Financial support for outreach to improve both day and night time enrollment.
4. Updating the facility as outlined in our objectives from media request to furniture, floor reconditioning, and painting.
5. Student community support by being flexible on low enrollment classes that are not offered but once every 12 to 18 months and not being so concerned with load numbers and more concerned with being able to offer an education to our students even when enrollment is low.

##### **Long-term results to achieve:**

1. Having enough evening enrollment to support six to eight sections.
2. Having overwhelmingly enrollment that we would need to return to seven full-time instructors and we are authorized to hire a 7th instructor.
3. An awning with lighting covering the parking lot between buildings 9 and 10. This would also include wind breaks between the links of the chain link fence. Estimated at approximately. \$500.000.00.

#### **Key Findings**

The biggest key findings and aspirations are the negative impact upon the students and the program from not receiving authorization to hire replacement instructors for our two retiring instructors.

#### **Unrealistic wish**

1. Contracts like the ones we have with Worldwide and Safety Kleen would not be so difficult to get through legal and the district.
2. Equivalency guidelines that would allow us to hire instructors who are qualified through experience but may not have an AS or BS degree.

#### **V.A. Program Strategy**

Based on the key findings and aspirations, develop a plan designed to enhance the quality of the program. Describe the strategy (or strategies) to be implemented over the next six years. Strategies could include intended changes or areas of inquiry to pursue.

[NOTE: In the next item, objectives will be created with action steps and resource requests to support each strategy identified here. Each objective will also be tied to an Institutional Goal.]

#### **Narrative**

##### **Career Track Program:**

Based on key findings the Automotive program career track classes have been on the upswing in enrollment. Retention and success rates are excellent and student Certificates of Achievement are off the chart. FTES and Certificates outpaces all other community college Automotive Programs. In the fall of 2017 the State Chancellor's office reported that Skyline College earned 2 CTE STARS. Our graduates reported 100% employment and 71% reported they earn a living wage in the Bay Area.

The Automotive Career Track Program is currently on a good pathway that is now going to be totally disrupted because we have been denied the ability to rehire two instructors for our two retiring instructors. One instructor teaches in our daytime career track program and the other instructor teaches our afternoon Asian technology career track classes.

In order to understand our strategy you must also understand how our program works. Some of the following information is designed to do this in the shortest possible manner.

Here is quick program overview to put everything in perspective: The Automotive department career track program is comprised of six 15-unit core classes that encompass all Automotive Service Excellence (ASE) certifications. Each course we offer combined with one of our fundamentals classes earns the student a Certificate of Achievement. Students enter into our program with Math, English and Automotive fundamentals prerequisites through a special application. Once a student has been accepted into our career track program they will work their way through each of the six classes over the course of three years. After three semesters the student will have enough Automotive credits for an AS degree. Our 97% retention rate is evidence that our students don't drop out because they prefer the depth of education this structure provides. This program structure is mirror with minor alteration for our Asian afternoon program. The Asian courses that are offered have been designed to fit into a two year program. All of these courses are taught in a sequence by one instructor. As you can see by losing our Asian program career track instructor we will have to close that program. Additionally by losing the instructor that teaches one of the daytime career track courses a delay will be created for all of our students seeking a degree and certificates. All of our courses are single section courses and losing two full-time instructors will have a devastating effect on course offerings and student completions. This could displace 30 – 40 students and delay new student enrollment for over a year.

For a comprehensive explanation and history about our program, how it works and why it is so successful I recommend you read the attached document. (Auto-2019-Program-Operation-Overview.pdf.)

The department is currently attempting to recruit a part-time professor to teach one section for one of the retiring instructors. The afternoon Asian technology sections that are taught by the retiring professor will have to be canceled and the daytime program will make an attempt to absorb those students. Some students may have to be put on a wait list and unable to continue their automotive education as planned.

Locating and hiring qualified quality automotive instructors who can teach during the daytime is extremely difficult. All of the qualified technicians capable of teaching the depth of education we provide are all working as technicians during daytime hours. If the department is unable to secure a part-time instructor for one of the two sections, we may have to cancel two sections which will increase the number of students we will have to turn away and there will be no room to enroll any new students for two semesters.

This is not our idea of serving our students and our community but these are the cards that have been dealt to Automotive.

From our perspective, we do not feel all of the statistical data was considered when we were denied our two replacement positions. Automotive could not help but feel the decision was not "Students first" data driven. Additionally, Chancellor Ron Galatolo, Board of Trustee Karen Schwartz, and former Board of Trustee president Tom Mohr all supported the rehiring of two replacement instructors in addition to Automotive keeping its current program structure of 15-unit classes.

Automotive plans to resubmit the instructor replacement application to the new administration in July after President Stanback-Stroud retires. If two replacement instructors are authorized, the Automotive department and all of our students can be restored back to the order and positive pathway we were on.

### **Entire Automotive Program:**

The health of the entire program is on an upswing, however the decline in evening course enrollment since the implementation of the repeatability laws slowly decimated our evening program enrollment. The declining evening program data dilutes the positive data that is associated with our daytime career track program. For this reason the statistical data for the Automotive program day and evening classes should be compared separately.

### **Evening Program:**

Here is a quick overview of our evening program. Our evening program is originally designed for working professionals. We offer smaller units class to fit the lifestyle of a working technician. The classes are design with less lab because the students typically get that experience at work. The classes are open to everyone with no prerequisites.

Dealership technicians typically get training from the manufacture. This is why we need to target our market outreach to local independent auto repair businesses and be involved with our local Automotive Service Councils of California (ASCCA) chapter.

Our plan is to continue to offer fewer sections while using the remainder of our funds from our Littlefield grant to pay for an instructor to perform onsite outreach visits to local automotive businesses.

Additionally we have already started the implementation of making changes to some of our core evening courses. We have consolidate several half-semester courses into semester length courses that offer a more comprehensive educational experience.

We now implement a course questionnaire to our current students and our business community on future semester course offerings.

We are in the process of the implementation of a survey for our local community of automotive businesses to seek out new and innovative courses to offer.

### **Weekend Program:**

Classes on the weekend are offered to train industry professionals in Smog Update so they can keep their licenses active. The number of sections we offer per year has been reduced to improve enrollment numbers. Since we started to offering fewer sections, each class often exceeded the enrollment limit. We plan to continue to advertise these classes in the same manner and spread the word through outreach mentioned later in this document. The decline in smog technician enrollment is due to new licensing laws. Technicians are electing to obtain Inspection licenses as compared to Repair licenses. Inspection licenses do not require the technician to attend update training.

Additionally, once a year we offer a Car Care Basics for Women weekend class. We have reduced this from twice a year to maximize enrollment numbers. This course has brought in several former and current female students into our career track Automotive program. We plan to implement more marketing flyers in the waiting rooms of local automotive businesses along with libraries and community centers.

### **Fundamentals Program:**

Our fundamentals program is on track and receives enrollment advantages from all of the high school outreach we do and plan to do under the strategic plan section below.

Strategic Plan:

- Continue to request instructor rehires to return the program back to six full-time instructors.
- Continue with our Driving your Future (DYF) outreach to high schools with and without automotive programs.
- Continue to work with and support events hosted by Workforce Development.
- Continue to survey our current evening class students to determine the next semester demand for classes.

- Continue to be involved in the local Automotive Service Councils of California (ASCCA) association and specifically the local chapter. This is an association of independent automotive repair businesses in California.
- Continue to renew our National Automotive Technicians Education Foundation (NATEF) certification.
- Continue to pursue professional development both in Automotive Technology and instructional pedagogy.
- Continue to seek out and implement new technology training equipment and methods.
- Continue to work with and follow the guidance of our advisory board.
- Continue to be involved in Expanding Your Horizons (EYH) event. This event has brought in some of our current and past female students.
- Implement aggressive outreach to local automotive businesses. Leveraging our Littlefield grant funds to pay for personnel to perform this outreach.
- Implement more visits to high school automotive programs.
- Implement an aggressive marketing plan through video, ads, social media and website development using Workforce Development and our marketing department and paying for this with the remainder of our Littlefield grant funds.
- Survey our community of employers on classes they would like to see us offer.
- Implement a counselors Automotive Technology starter kit for all high school counselors in San Mateo and San Francisco.
- Implement a task force between the Automotive department and counseling to enhance the pathway to AS degrees for all of our students who seek an AS degree.

### **Evidentiary Documents**

[Auto-2019-Program-Operational-Overview.pdf](#)

**V.B. Action Plan and Resources Requests**

Develop one or more measurable objectives (goals) to begin in the next year. Each objective will include action steps and any related resource requests. No narrative response will be entered in this section, but the objectives you create will be printed automatically in the CPR report under this item.

1. To begin, click on PLANNING at the top of the page, then CREATE A NEW OBJECTIVE. To view previously created objectives, click PLANNING at the top of the page, then VIEW MY OBJECTIVE.
2. IMPORTANT! Make sure to associate each objective to this standard in the CPR and link each objective to one or more Institutional Goals. Need help? Contact the PRIE Office for further instructions.

**Narrative**

See objectives

**Associated Objectives**

[725-Advisory Board Course Objective & Curriculum Review](#)

[726-Classroom Learning Environment](#)

[727-Enrollment - Outreach](#)

[738-Expand Lab Space](#)

[728-Professional Development](#)

[739-Rehire replacements for retired instructors](#)

[737-Student Certificates of Achievement](#)

[729-Update Facilities](#)

[730-Upgrade Media Learning Technology in Building 9 and 10](#)

**Budget Request**

[AUTO-CPR-BudgetRequest-2019-20](#)