# PEER REVIEW TEAM REPORT

Skyline College 3300 College Drive San Bruno, CA 94066

This report represents the findings of the Peer Review Team that visited Skyline College from September 30-October 3, 2019

> This report represents the findings of the External Evaluation Team that visited Skyline College - September 30-October 3, 2019

> > Linda Rose, Ed.D. Team Chair Skyline College Comprehensive Evaluation Visit

# **Team Roster**

Linda Rose, Ed.D., **Team Chair** Santa Ana College President

Dr. Vaniethia Hubbard, **Team Assistant** Santa Ana College Vice President, Student Services

# **ACADEMIC MEMBERS**

Dr. Douglas Achterman Gavilan College Head Librarian

Dr. Roland Finger Cuesta College Professor of English

Ms. Catherine Indermill Mendocino College Professor of Psychology

### **ADMINISTRATIVE MEMBERS**

Ms. Crystol Kollross Pasadena City College Executive Director of Institutional Effectiveness

Ms. Kira Tippins Clovis Community College Dean of Student Service

Dr. Jennifer Zellet Modesto Junior College Vice President of Instruction

### ACCJC STAFF LIAISON Dr. Richard Winn Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges President

# **Summary of Peer Review Report**

INSTITUTION:	Skyline College
DATES OF VISIT:	September 30, 2019 to October 3, 2019
TEAM CHAIR:	Linda Rose, Ed.D.

From September 30 through October 3, 2019 a nine-member External Peer Review Team, including one ACCJC Staff Liaison, conducted a site visit to Skyline College. The purpose of the visit was to confirm the College's assertion that it met current Accreditation Standards, Eligibility Requirements, and Commission Policies.

In preparation for the external peer review visit, team members prepared by reviewing the College's Institutional Self Evaluation Report. All team members received a USB flash drive that contained the College ISER, Catalog, and a Class Schedule. The flash drive was mailed several weeks prior to the visit. The team chair also attended a full-day training facilitated by ACCJC staff on August 1, 2019, from 8:00 a.m. - 5:00 p.m. visit. Training materials distributed to team chairs in attendance included a USB flash drive. The flash drive contained ACCJC Publications, The Team Roster, ACCJC Information about Skyline College, Policy on Commission Actions on Institutions, and sample documents to help Team Chairs prepare before, during, and after the official peer review visit. ACCJC staff presented information that included scenarios to foster active participation during the training.

Thereafter, the team Chair conducted a pre-visit to Skyline College on August 16, 2019 to meet with the interim President and members of the college's key constituent groups to discuss logistics and answer questions related to the fall 2019 peer review visit.

Subsequently, members of the external peer review team, including the team Chair attended a full-day interactive training facilitated by ACCJC on September 4, 2019. During this training, team members and the team chair had the opportunity to discuss logistics of the upcoming visit, ask questions and share concerns they may have had related to College's Institutional Self Evaluation Report and the first team assignment they had completed. The team discussed their initial findings based on their review of the College's ISER. The team discussed the need for additional information, such as documents or names of individuals or groups they wanted to interview during the peer review visit. On September 29, 2019, the day before the site visit, the peer review team met in the team room at the hotel. This meeting allowed the team to discuss concerns and ask questions and be reintroduced to each other.

Finally, during the visit, the peer review team found the campus community to be accommodating and responsive to the team's requests for information during interviews. On the first day of the visit, College staff provided the visiting team with an extensive tour of the campus. This tour later enhanced the teams visit because it was easier to locate programs and services.

The College demonstrated its engagement in the accreditation process. For example, more than 30 individuals, including external Community members attended the two college forums facilitated by the Chair and peer review team members. Team accommodations on campus were appropriate for the team's efforts to conduct interviews and draft the Peer Review Report.

### **Skyline College - Commendations and Recommendations**

### Team Commendations Commendations

The Team commends Skyline College for exceeding several Standards by demonstrating a deep commitment to equity and equality campus wide. An equity mindset permeates the campus culture for students and employees. For example, professional development activities such as the Equity Training Series (ETS), Equity Institute and the Equity Summit reflect active engagement of faculty, staff, administrators and students in the evaluation of existing organizational structures with the intent to make changes as appropriate to improve student completion and success. This commitment is also evidenced by the engagement of the entire campus community in the Skyline College Comprehensive Redesign project. (I.B.I), (II.A.7), (III.A.14)

The team commends institutional leaders as they create and encourage innovation leading to institutional excellence related to equity. This is evidenced by use of the President's Innovation Fund (PIF), Comprehensive College Re-Design, and the development of the Respiratory Care Baccalaureate degree (IV.A.1) (IV.A.5)

#### **Team Recommendations**

Recommendations to Meet Standards None

# **Recommendations to Improve Quality**

None

#### Introduction

Skyline College was established in 1969 on the San Francisco Peninsula in San Bruno, California as a public degree and certificate granting institution. The campus consists of 111 acres bounded by residential developments and the Golden Gate National Recreation Area. The college is one of three colleges that comprise the San Mateo County Community College District (SMCCCD) Skyline college primarily serves northern San Mateo County and southern portions of the City and County of San Francisco. The communities closest to Skyline College include Brisbane, Colma, Daly City, Millbrae, Pacifica, and South San Francisco. Skyline College is also located in close proximity to Silicon Valley, considered a hub for innovation, entrepreneurship, technology, research, and STEM fields.

While the college operates a single campus at 3300 College Drive, San Bruno, California, courses, seminars and workshops for community members, employers, small businesses, faculty, staff and students are also hosted, by the college at the BAEC. The Center is located at 458 San Mateo Avenue, in downtown San Bruno.

Skyline College operates as part of a multi-college district under the jurisdiction of the SMCCCD six-member Board of Trustees. The five elected members represent specific parts of the county and serve staggered four-year terms with the non-voting student member elected annually by the student body. In 2015-2016, Skyline College began a mapping project to clarify the local demographics and characteristics of feeder high schools in the College's surrounding communities. In addition, an analysis of the Economic Modeling Specialists International (EMSI) database was used to determine local labor market needs and projected future employment opportunities. The College identified five employment segments with the highest employment opportunities which include management, business and financial operations, computer and mathematical occupations, architecture and engineering as well as occupations within the life, physical, and social sciences.

As Skyline College celebrates its 50<sup>th</sup> year serving students and surrounding communities they have embarked upon one of the largest campus-wide initiatives to help students reach their goals through the Skyline College Promise/Comprehensive College Redesign. The College has committed to create opportunities for the college to engage in a continuous examination of itself through the lens of the Comprehensive Diversity Framework (CDF) The three signature components of this comprehensive redesign include the development and implementation of Meta Majors and Guided Pathways, Promise Scholars Program, and Transformative Teaching and Learning. The Skyline College Community, through this effort seeks to challenge the traditional "college-ready" student paradigm and replace it with a "student-ready" institutional approach.

# **Eligibility Requirements**

# 1. Authority

The team confirmed that Skyline College is authorized to operate as a post-secondary, degree-granting institution based on continuous accreditation by the Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges (ACCJC) of the Western Association of Schools and Colleges (WASC) ACCJC is a regional accrediting body recognized by the U.S. Department of Education and granted authority through the Higher Education Opportunity Act of 2008.

The College meets the ER.

### 2. Operational Status

The team confirmed that the College is operational and provided educational services to 15,351 students for the 2018-19 academic year. Approximately 72 percent of these students are pursuing goals that relate to attainment of a degree, certificate, or transfer.

The College meets the ER.

### 3. Degrees

The team confirmed that the majority of courses offered at Skyline College lead to a degree, certificate, or transfer. A majority of Skyline's students are enrolled in courses leading to transfer and/or a degree or certificate.

The College Meets the ER

### 4. Chief Executive Officer

The team confirmed that the Chancellor, employed by the Governing Board, has delegated full responsibility to the College CEO to implement and administer delegated district and system policies without interference and holds the College CEO accountable for the operation of the college.

The College meets the ER.

# 5. Financial Accountability

The team confirmed that Skyline College engages a qualified external auditor to conduct audits of all financial records. All audits are certified and all explanations of findings are documented appropriately. Audit reports are made available to the public.

The College meets the ER.

# **Checklist for Evaluating Compliance with Federal Regulations and Related Commission Policies**

# Public Notification of an Evaluation Team Visit and Third-Party Comment

[Regulation citation: 602.23(b)]

# **Evaluation Items:**

- × The institution has made an appropriate and timely effort to solicit third party comment in advance of a comprehensive evaluation visit. (Standard 1.C.12,)
- × The institution cooperates with the evaluation team in any necessary follow-up related to the third-party comment. (Standard 1.C.12)
- × The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission *Policy on Rights and Responsibilities of the Commission and Member Institutions* as to third party comment.

# Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):

- × The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
- The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but follow-up is recommended.
- \_\_\_\_\_ The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

# Narrative:

The team found no third-party comments related to the October 2019 Team visit.

# Standards and Performance with Respect to Student Achievement

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(i); 602.17(f); 602.19 (a-e)]

# **Evaluation Items:**

- × The institution has defined elements of student achievement performance across the institution, and has identified the expected measure of performance within each defined element. Course completion is included as one of these elements of student achievement. Other elements of student achievement performance for measurement have been determined as appropriate to the institution's mission. (Standard I.B.3 and Section B. Presentation of Student Achievement Data and Institution-set Standards)
- × The institution has defined elements of student achievement performance within each instructional program, and has identified the expected measure of performance within each defined element. The defined elements include, but are not limited to, job placement rates for program completers, and for programs in fields where licensure is required, the licensure examination passage rates for program completers. (Standard I.B.3 and Section B. Presentation of Student Achievement Data and Institution-set Standards)
- × The institution-set standards for programs and across the institution are relevant to guide self-evaluation and institutional improvement; the defined elements and expected performance levels are appropriate within higher education; the results are reported regularly across the campus; and the definition of elements and results are used in program-level and institution-wide planning to evaluate how well the institution fulfills

its mission, to determine needed changes, to allocating resources, and to make improvements. (Standard I.B.3, Standard I.B.9)

× The institution analyzes its performance as to the institution-set standards and as to student achievement, and takes appropriate measures in areas where its performance is not at the expected level. (Standard I.B.4)

### Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):

- × The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
- \_\_\_\_\_ The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
- \_\_\_\_\_ The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

### Narrative:

Team members confirmed that Skyline College has established Institutional Set Standards. Communication about the outcomes from the evaluation is provided to the campus community and the Board of Trustees.

### Credits, Program Length, and Tuition

[Regulation citations: 600.2 (definition of credit hour); 602.16(a)(1)(viii); 602.24(e), (f); 668.2; 668.9.]

### **Evaluation Items:**

- × Credit hour assignments and degree program lengths are within the range of good practice in higher education (in policy and procedure) (Standard II.A.9)
- × The assignment of credit hours and degree program lengths is verified by the institution, and is reliable and accurate across classroom-based courses, laboratory classes, distance education classes, and for courses that involve clinical practice (if applicable to the institution) (Standard II.A.9)
- × Tuition is consistent across degree programs (or there is a rational basis for any programspecific tuition) (Standard I.C.2)
- × Any clock hour conversions to credit hours adhere to the Department of Education's conversion formula, both in policy and procedure, and in practice. (Standard II.A.9)
- × The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission *Policy on Institutional Degrees and Credits*.

# **Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):**

- × The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
- The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.

\_\_\_\_\_ The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

### Narrative:

The Team confirmed that Skyline College offers degrees and programs that follow practices which include the appropriate length, breadth, depth, and rigor as indicated by an array of articulation agreements with four-year institutions. The College awards course credit, degrees,

and certificates for associates and the Bachelor of Science degree based in part on the attainment of learning outcomes which are developed at the department level. Course level student learning outcomes align with the course objectives given in the course outline of record. The course outlines of record, the college catalog, and the schedule of classes demonstrate that units of credit for lecture, laboratory and clinical practice courses, including courses offered through distance education confirm to the Carnegie Unit for the quarter system, with 12 lecture hours or 36 lab hours for each unit of credit, reflecting generally accepted norms in higher education.

# **Transfer Policies**

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a) (1)(viii); 602.17(a)(3); 602.24(e); 668.43(a)(ii)]

# **Evaluation Items:**

- × Transfer policies are appropriately disclosed to students and to the public. (Standard II.A.10)
- × Policies contain information about the criteria the institution uses to accept credits for transfer. (Standard II.A.10)
- × The institution complies with the Commission *Policy on Transfer of Credit*.

# **Conclusion Check-Off:**

- × The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
- The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
- The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

# Narrative:

Skyline College describes transfer policies, course and program requirements, as well as stated learning outcomes for its Associate and Bachelor degrees, and certificates in the college catalog and on the college website.

# **Distance Education and Correspondence Education**

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(iv), (vi); 602.17(g); 668.38.]

# **Evaluation Items:**

# For Distance Education:

- × The institution demonstrates regular and substantive interaction between students and the instructor.
- × The institution demonstrates comparable learning support services and student support services for distance education students. (Standards II.B.1, II.C.1)
- × The institution verifies that the student who registers in a distance education program is the same person who participates every time and completes the course or program and receives the academic credit.

# For Correspondence Education:

- **NA** The institution demonstrates comparable learning support services and student support services for correspondence education students. (Standards II.B.1, II.C.1)
- **NA** The institution verifies that the student who registers in a correspondence education program is the same person who participates every time and completes the course or program and receives the academic credit.

# **Overall:**

- × The technology infrastructure is sufficient to maintain and sustain the distance education and correspondence education offerings. (Standard III.C.1)
- × The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission Policy on Distance Education and Correspondence Education.

### **Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):**

- × The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
- \_\_\_\_\_ The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
- \_\_\_\_\_ The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

\_ The College does not offer Distance Education or Correspondence Education.

### Narrative:

Online and hybrid course offerings must be approved at the department and division level before the course is presented to the Division and Curriculum Committee. The college has division guidelines and training requirements for distance learning.

### **Student Complaints**

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(ix); 668.43.]

### **Evaluation Items:**

- × The institution has clear policies and procedures for handling student complaints, and the current policies and procedures are accessible to students in the college catalog and online.
- × The student complaint files for the previous seven years (since the last comprehensive evaluation) are available; the files demonstrate accurate implementation of the complaint policies and procedures.
- × The team analysis of the student complaint files identifies any issues that may be indicative of the institution's noncompliance with any Accreditation Standards.
- × The institution posts on its website the names of associations, agencies and governmental bodies that accredit, approve, or license the institution and any of its programs, and provides contact information for filing complaints with such entities. (Standard I.C.1)
- × The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission *Policy on Representation* of Accredited Status and Policy on Student and Public Complaints Against Institutions.

### **Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):**

- × The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
  - The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
- \_\_\_\_\_ The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

### Narrative:

The Team confirmed that Skyline College has an established procedure for student grievances in order to provide a means to resolve alleged unfair or improper action by any member of the academic community.

# Institutional Disclosure and Advertising and Recruitment Materials

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(vii); 668.6.]

# **Evaluation Items:**

- × The institution provides accurate, timely (current), and appropriately detailed information to students and the public about its programs, locations, and policies. (Standard I.C.2)
- × The institution complies with the Commission Policy on *Institutional Advertising*, *Student Recruitment*, and Policy on Representation of Accredited Status.
- × The institution provides required information concerning its accredited status. (Standard I.C.12)

# **Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):**

- × The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
- \_\_\_\_\_ The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
- \_\_\_\_\_ The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

# Narrative:

Skyline College's website provides information about its accredited status. The site provides accurate, current, and detailed information about its programs, locations, and policies. This information is available to students, and members of the public in the college catalog as well. The catalog is available in both digital and print media format.

# **Title IV Compliance**

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(v); 602.16(a)(1)(x); 602.19(b); 668.5; 668.15; 668.16; 668.71 et seq.]

# **Evaluation Items:**

- × The institution has presented evidence on the required components of the Title IV Program, including findings from any audits and program or other review activities by the USDE. (Standard III.D.15)
- × If applicable, the institution has addressed any issues raised by the USDE as to financial responsibility requirements, program record-keeping, etc. If issues were not timely addressed, the institution demonstrates it has the fiscal and administrative capacity to timely address issues in the future and to retain compliance with Title IV program requirements. (Standard III.D.15)
- × If applicable, the institution's student loan default rates are within the acceptable range defined by the USDE. Remedial efforts have been undertaken when default rates near or meet a level outside the acceptable range. (Standard III.D.15)
- × If applicable, contractual relationships of the institution to offer or receive educational, library, and support services meet the Accreditation Standards and have been approved by the Commission through substantive change if required. (Standard III.D.16)
- × The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission *Policy on Contractual Relationships with Non-Regionally Accredited Organizations* and the Policy on *Institutional Compliance with Title IV.*

# **Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):**

× The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.

- \_\_\_\_\_ The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
- \_\_\_\_\_ The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

### Narrative:

The team confirmed that the College's Cohort Default rate of less than 15 percent is within the acceptable range defined by the USDE.

# **Standard IA. Mission**

# **General Observations**

Skyline College is guided by its mission, vision, and value statements, collectively known as M/V/V. The M/V/V articulates the college's purpose, the students it serves, and its commitment to student learning and achievement. The M/V/V is central to the college's educational purpose and guides the college's planning and decision-making. The college has established program review and annual planning processes that align the programs, services, and resources with the college's M/V/V. The college has in place an Educational Master Plan, Technology Master Plan, and a Comprehensive Diversity Framework (CDF) that flow from the M/V/V. The use of student learning achievement and assessment data informs program review, annual planning, and decisions on resource allocation.

# Findings and Evidence

The College's M/V/V clearly defines the college's broad education purpose and its commitment to student learning. The college is deeply committed to using the M/V/V to guide its institutional processes and decision-making. The team confirmed the mission statement was reviewed by the Board of Trustees in December of 2018 after an extensive review using the college's participatory governance process. The college uses its participatory governance process to ensure the mission is regularly reviewed. The college's Institutional Effectiveness committee (IEC) is charged with the regular review of the M/V/V and to bring forth recommendations for college-wide review. (I.A.1, I.A.4)

The team confirmed through a review of the online planning and program review software (SPOL) that the college uses disaggregated student data and learning assessment data in its program review process to determine if the college is effectively accomplishing its M/V/V. Evidence to this effect was provided in the Institutional Self-Evaluation Report and it was confirmed by a review of the college's office of Planning Research and Institutional Effectiveness (PRIE) and posted documents on the college website and in SPOL. The college's Annual Program Plan (APP) process aligns with the College's M/V/V.

Furthermore, PRIE provides disaggregated data on program completion, course success and retention rates and transfer rates, available on the college website and through SPOL. The College developed a Scorecard to define and measure its strategic goals and initiatives that includes cohort tracking for college level math and English completion, degree/certificate completion, and transfers. The Scorecard aligns with the M/V/V. The Scorecard is updated annually and posted on the college's website. (I.A.2, I.A.3)

The M/V/V is published on the college's website and the team confirmed it is in the Educational Master Plan, College Annual Reports, and in the faculty handbook. The M/V/V is widely distributed across the campus and it was confirmed by the team that campus constituents understand and work to achieve the M/V/V. The team reviewed the college's online planning and program review process and it clearly uses data to evaluate and inform the M/V/V, strategic and annual planning, and resource allocation (I.A.4, ER 6)

# **Conclusion**

The college meets the standard and related Eligibility Requirements

# **IB.** Assuring Academic Quality and Institutional Effectiveness

### **General Observations**

Academic quality is assured through ongoing dialog and assessment via a number of processes, including the Program Review Cycle, Curriculum Committee approvals process, and professional development training. Student Learning Outcomes are addressed by way of the curriculum processes and the course outline of record. Standards for student achievement have been established and are consistent with the college's Mission, Vision and Values (MVV) statement.

# Findings and Evidence

The team confirmed that the college has a robust structure of committees that are tasked with addressing equity, effectiveness and improvement of academic quality. For example, the Student Learning Outcome Assessment Cycle (SLOAC) provides a structure for assessment of learning outcomes which includes the Bachelor's in Science in Respiratory Care. The Office of Planning, Research and Institutional Effectiveness (PRIE), Institutional Effectiveness Committee (ICE) and College Success Initiative (CSI) play important roles in dialoging about and ensuring achievement and planning for continued improvement (I.B.1)

The team confirmed that all courses have Student Learning Outcomes (SLO's) and all programs have Program Student Learning Outcomes (PSLOs), including those for the Bachelor's in Science in Respiratory Care. In addition, course level outcomes are reviewed on a regular basis. Information in the Skyline College Score Card demonstrate the institutional standards that are met. The District Strategic Plan was developed to emphasize student success, equity and social justice informed by data obtained from the District Scorecard. The Scorecard is used to assess student learning. During interviews the team learned that an additional Scorecard specific to the Bachelor's in Science in Respiratory Care has been developed and is now available and will soon be posted on the program website. (I.B. 2, I.B.3, I.B.4.)

Academic quality is also addressed via assessment of achievement gaps reported by academic programs in their program review and resource needs are prioritized by the academic deans, and then by the Vice President of Instruction, for consideration by separate committees, for example Faculty FTE Committee, Instructional Equipment Committee, that make resource allocation recommendations to the President. It is noted in the Institutional Self Evaluation Report (ISER) that courses in the Bachelor's in Science in Respiratory Care include appropriate upper division levels of learning which also support academic quality. The Curriculum Committee website includes a list of Common Characteristics of Upper Division Courses confirm this. (I.B.1, I.B.6, I.B.9)

The college has recently combined some decision-making committees in order to more effectively integrate planning and resource allocation. The resulting Strategic Planning and allocation of Resources Committee (SPARC) makes recommendations for college-wide planning and resource allocation. Planning objectives for all campus programs are aligned with the goals of the College and/or District in the program review documents. The Strategic Planning Outline

addresses this as well. Program review data is disaggregated by various key variables (e.g., race/ethnicity and gender) (I.B.5)

Student learning outcomes and achievement are analyzed regularly. The disaggregated data is used to identify performance gaps that may exist for subpopulations of students. Institutional Student Learning Outcomes are disaggregated by ethnicity, age and gender. The subpopulations identified by the college include: unit load and demographics and modality of instruction. Academic Programs report outcome and achievement gaps via Annual Program Plans (APP) program review. The team found that individual departments have worked to mitigate achievement gaps via pedagogy and/or curricular changes. Plans are made to remove barriers and recruit underrepresented students. For example, the Chemistry CPR indicates plans to increase student support, tutoring, and partnership with MESA and existing learning communities. Strategic Planning and Allocation of Resources Committee (SPARC) makes recommendations of Fund 1 resource allocation (human, physical, financial, and/or technical) based on the data provided in the Skyline College Scorecard, and with consideration for how the College's programs and initiatives align with the Colleges Education Master Plan and MVV. (I.B.6)

Curriculum and Educational board policies and procedures are the responsibility of the Curriculum and Educational Policy Committees, respectively. It is noted that district board policies and administrative procedures are reviewed "regularly" and updated "as needed". However, it is not clear what sort of cycle is used. (I.B.7)

The *Employee Voice Survey* was recently used to inform Strategic Planning and Allocation of Resources Committee about how to revise the program review cycle to make it more effective and to more closely align with the Mission Vision and Values in order to drive resource allocation. The *Employee Voice Survey* was also used to assess campus processes, elicit discussion and improvements in integrated planning and resource allocation. Team interviews confirmed the use of the survey in reconfiguring the planning and budgeting committees into one cohesive cross functional committee. The ISER states that the district reviews policies and procedure related to "effective" participatory governance, but the periodicity of the cycle is not clear. (I.B.7)

The team confirmed that the College communicates the results of assessment and evaluation activities via the website for Program Review, Institutional Effectiveness Committee (IEC) This allows easy access for constituent groups. Further, newly hired tenure-track faculty are provided with this information during the "New Faculty Academy." Both the strengths and weaknesses addressed in the program review processes are identified. The planning committees develop institutional priorities based on the findings. (I.B.8)

The team reviewed documentation to confirm the College's continuous, broad based, systematic planning though the College's use of Annual Program Plans (APP) and Comprehensive Program Review (CPR) Annual Program Plans are developed from program review each year and Comprehensive Program Reviews are completed every six years and are completed by academic and student services areas. The program review processes were revised a few years ago and appear to have maintained consistency. Requests for human, physical, physical, financial, and/or technical resources generated from program reviews are analyzed by Strategic Planning and Allocation of Resources that makes recommendations for expenditures based on short and long-term program needs based on the alignment and relevance with and support of the Mission

Vision and Values. The team confirmed a broad involvement of various decision-making committees responsible for planning and resource allocation. (I.B.9)

# Conclusion

The college meets Standard I.B. In addition, the Bachelor's in Science in Respiratory Care meets Standard I.B.

# **IC. Institutional Integrity**

# **General Observations**

The main source of information about the college, its education programs and student services, can be found in the College catalog, which is available on the College website in pdf format and in an interactive format. Both versions provide students with a comprehensive overview of the college, student instructional programs, and support services. The College provides an online version of the catalog that is searchable as well as a print version that can be downloaded in pdf format. The college provides the current catalog version as well as access to previous versions online. Through its Board Policies and Administrative Procedures, the College ensures integrity in its communication with students and the public. The college website includes a webpage dedicated to informing the public and internal constituents on all aspects of the college's accreditation.

# Findings and Evidence

The team confirmed that the College Catalog is the main source of information on learning outcomes, educational programs, and student support services. The College catalog is comprehensive and provides an overview of the college governance structure and includes the M/V/V, College goals, institutional learning outcomes as well as a complete listing of educational programs and student support services. In addition, the team confirmed the college catalog provides information on policies covering student conduct, transfer of credit, fees, program length, and availability of Financial Aid. The team confirmed that the contents of the college catalog are updated annually and information about instructional programs is sourced directly from CurricUNET, the college's curriculum software data warehouse for instructional programs. (I.C.1)

The team confirmed that an online searchable version of the current and previous years' catalogs is available on the college's website and can be downloaded in full or just the pages that someone may need. Each catalog version contains information on program requirements, college policies, regulations, and student support services. The college catalog also describes the certificate and degree programs offered by the college and information on tuition, fees, and other required expenses. Fee information is also available on the registration website for the college. Furthermore, the college provides on its website complete information on each instructional program including program outcomes, required coursework, length of program, and possible career opportunities. (I.C.4, I.C.6)

The team reviewed evidence to confirm that the Annual Program Plan (APP) and the Comprehensive Program Review (CPR) use documented assessment of student learning and disaggregated data packages provided by the Office of Planning, Research and Institutional Effectiveness (PRIE) and this data is communicated to the appropriate constituents, which includes instructional departments. The College also provided evidence of "town hall" meetings where data on student achievement and its relationship to student learning is analyzed and discussed by campus constituents. The team confirmed that the College produces and distributes an Annual Report, Scorecard, Fact Sheet, and a weekly newsletter, Skyline Shines, which is widely distributed and contains information on student learning and achievement in addition to general information about the college and its students. (I.C.3)

The team confirmed that the college has in place a Board Policy directing the regular review of all Board Policies and procedures. Through documents available in the ISER and in interviews with college constituents, the team confirmed that the college is committed to and ensures integrity in how it represents itself online and in print in regards to its mission, programs, and services. Additionally, the team verified the college has Board Policies on academic freedom and responsibility, academic integrity, academic honesty, and student conduct that are published on the college's website and in their interactive and print college catalog. (I.C.5, I.C.7, I.C.8)

The team confirmed the Governing Council of the San Mateo Community College District (SMCCD) adopted the Statement of Professional Ethics of the American Association of University Professors for the district. This ethics statement is included in the Skyline Faculty Handbook and is used by faculty to distinguish between personal conviction and professionally accepted views. (I.C.9)

Skyline College does not require any conformity to specific codes of conduct nor seek to instill a particular world view. Skyline College is a member of the California Community College system and adheres to California Education code with regards to open access and open entry. Furthermore, the team confirmed that Skyline College has no foreign operations or extended campuses in a foreign country. Thus Standards I.C.10 and I.C.11 are not applicable to Skyline College.

The team confirmed that Skyline College has a webpage on its website dedicated to accreditation information. Internal and external constituents can access all documents related to the college's accreditation. The team reviewed the college's accreditation webpage and confirmed it demonstrated honestly and integrity in its relationships with external agencies and the community. The team verified that the college complies with and posts on its website all accreditation reports related to Commission policies, regulations, Eligibility Requirements, and Accreditation Standards. The team confirmed that all correspondence with the Commission and all Commission-requested reports are on the college's accreditation webpage and available for public review. (I.C.12)

Moreover, Skyline discloses information on its accredited status in the college catalog both in the pdf format and the interactive web format, in addition to maintaining an accreditation webpage on its college website, the College also includes current information on its relationship with other

accrediting bodies and external partners on its accreditation webpage and its status on individual program accreditation. The team confirmed that Skyline College is consistent in how it describes itself to outside agencies, including those providing program-specific accreditation, and its accredited status in all public and internal communications. (I.C.13)

Through the M/V/V the college articulates its commitment to high quality education, student learning, and achievement. As an open access, publicly funded institution, it uses its financial resources to support student instructional programs and services to ensure students are achieving their educational goals. The team confirmed during interviews with Academic and Student Services Deans and the Faculty Academic Senate Leadership, that the college focuses college resources on instructional programs and student support services to ensure students are achieving their educational goals. The college does not generate financial returns for external interests. The team confirmed that the college uses the M/V/V to guide the college's Strategic Goals and Initiatives and all other master planning documents which are available on the college's website. (I.C.14)

# Conclusion

The College meets the Standard.

# **Standard IIA. Instructional Programs**

### **General Observations**

Skyline College demonstrates its commitment to its constituent groups by offering instructional programs appropriate to its Mission, Vision, and Values (MVV) These concise statements govern instruction offered in a variety of modalities and spaces, and curriculum is of sufficient rigor and quality to align with transfer institutions where applicable.

Skyline College demonstrates commitment to access by offering a wide range of course offerings including Dual Enrollment, CTE, Associate-level Transfer courses, and a Bachelor's in Science in Respiratory Care through a variety of modalities. In all of these, the institution honors policies and procedures that require regular assessment, revision, and approval of curriculum and learning outcomes to ensure currency and rigor. Skyline College's curricular processes are appropriately consultative, and the assessment and Program Review components promote continuous, data-driven improvements to the programs.

The Guided Pathways component of the Complete College Redesign has reorganized the college into four Meta Majors that sculpt the student journey so that the student experiences a decrease both in time to completion and the number of units acquired on the way. The principles of Equity and Innovation infuse program construction and offerings.

### Findings and Evidence

The team verified that program offerings, regardless of modality, align with the MVV of Skyline college, which is "...to empower and transform a global community of learners." The course and program offerings have expanded to reach a baccalaureate audience, and all of the coursework aligns ultimately with the MVV using established processes of Curriculum origination and approval, regular PSLO assessment, and Program Review at all programmatic levels of the institution from associate to baccalaureate. Curriculum, courses and programs are deemed appropriate for post-secondary education, both at the associate degree and baccalaureate level, by adhering to state and local policies, and as evidenced by articulations that exist between Skyline College and four-year partner institutions and external accreditations for the Bachelor's in Science in Respiratory Care. The team confirmed the participation of full- and part-time faculty in the review and redesign of curriculum, courses, and programs, and through interviews and observation of meetings, verified the commitment to carry out the MVV. The baccalaureate degree is compliant to these standards as well. (II.A.1, II.A.2)

The team confirmed that there are processes in place for regular assessment of Student Learning Outcomes and encountered evidence of SLO assessment in a 3-year cycle with resulting assessment plans. TracDat is used to record the assessment cycle and all pertinent documents. The team verified that the same process applies to the Bachelor's in Science in Respiratory Care program, and that the relevant required CTE data (e.g. number of graduates that attain the credential and gainful employment data) is collected for the program. (II.A.3)

The team verified that Skyline College offers pre-college programs in the form of Concurrent Enrollment, Dual Enrollment, Middle College, and Jump Start. The team noted institutional

support for pre-college programs (Academic Senate Minutes), and during interviews, the team learned of the new Outreach to Youth in Juvenile Hall program to assist this group with High School degree completion. (II.A.4)

Evidence shows that the institution's degrees and programs follow expected higher education practices and are of appropriate length, breadth, depth, and rigor from associate to baccalaureate level. The team verified the modification of the baccalaureate program schedule to ensure appropriateness of course sequencing, synthesis of learning, and appropriate rigor (II.A.5) Interviews with the Complete College Redesign Team affirmed that the organization into Meta Majors and the resulting program maps ensure that students experience appropriate course sequencing, an abbreviated time to completion, and synthesis of learning. An example of how the student experience is designed with intentionality is the process used for determining Program Maps. The team learned that program maps are in their fourth iteration, and each step has had a particular function: (1.) Faculty design path through major; (2.) Counseling Faculty review to ensure that the major maps are complete and accurate with regard to transfer patterns; (3.) AB705 Math Faculty edit to ensure that students are enrolling in the most appropriate math for their educational path; and (4.) Additional instructional faculty conduct a final review to determine skills for success and momentum points. (II.A.5)

The team confirmed through evidence presented and through interviews that Skyline College schedules courses in a manner that allows students to complete certificates and degrees within a time period consistent with established expectations, and these offerings are delivered in appropriate modalities and with effective teaching methodologies. An example of restructuring scheduling after reflecting on student need is the revamped schedule for the Bachelors in Science in Respiratory Care. Initially scheduled as a series of hybrid courses, the schedule now is 100% online, and the program courses are both compressed and offered in pairs such that each pair of courses shares at least two major assignments. The team reviewed professional development schedules from the CTTL verifying the FLEX day trainings that relate to teaching methodologies, pedagogy, and best practices. Review of online course offerings validated the learning support offered to students in that modality as well. The team noted common modules available for placement in all Canvas shells that linked to Netiquette, Online Learning Readiness, Helpdesk information, and how to access NetTutor, online Librarianship, 24-7 access to library services, and online Counseling. (II.A.6, II.A.7)

The team confirmed that the College awards course credit, degrees, and certificates based on student learning, and the units of credit awarded are consistent with institutional policies for all programs including the Bachelor's in Science in Respiratory Care. Evidence also showed that while there are no department-wide course and/or program examinations, there is existing board policy (BP6.18-201801) and institutional procedures (Website, catalog) that allow for credit by examination. Interviews with the faculty and dean for the Bachelor's in Science in Respiratory Care program reveal that the Credit by Examination policy is being explored to determine how it applies to the realm of Credit for Prior Learning and working Respiratory Therapists. Evidence also shows that in some CTE areas, there are external industry qualifying examinations that students can take to validate learning. (II.A.8, II.A.9, II.A.11)

The team reviewed the Skyline College website and college catalog to confirm that transfer of credit policies is readily available to the students. The San Mateo Community College District has a reciprocity policy (BP 6.26) that allows students to transfer/migrate among the three colleges in the district without penalty, though there may be programmatic idiosyncrasies from college to college. The team verified that additional transfer of credit policies includes Credit by Exam, foreign transcripts, high school coursework, and alternate external exams. The team confirmed that transfer of credit from other colleges is validated by Transfer Evaluation Services and Degree Works. The Skyline College catalog exemplifies articulations and the GE patterns that ensure transfer to both CSU and UC institutions. In addition, the team confirmed that the Bachelor's in Science in Respiratory Care program requires a minimum of 30 CSU GE units prior to program start, and of the required 30 upper division units, 15 are dedicated to upper division GE. (II.A.10)

Course Outlines of Record and the College Catalog exemplify that all programs include learning outcomes appropriate to the program level in the required competency areas of GE. The SLOAC webpage and College Catalog identify the five ISLOs derived from the AA/AS degree requirements: Critical Thinking, Effective Communication, Citizenship, Information Literacy, and Lifelong Wellness. The team verified that the Bachelors in Science in Respiratory Care PSLOs are consistent with the norms of higher education and appropriate to the level of learning. The website for the Respiratory Care program illustrates how the outcome measures are aligned with learning outcome standards at accredited four-year institutions. (II.A.11)

The team confirmed through evidence presented in the ISER and during interviews with various groups, that there is congruency between Skyline College's policy and the Board Policy on the Philosophy of General Education. The Skyline College Curriculum Committee Handbook evidences the faculty participation in the development of GE according to agreed-upon guidelines. These guidelines reflect the requirements of the CSU and IGETC patterns, with a minimum of 30 units, and the baccalaureate degree adds an additional 15 upper division units of GE. (II.A.12)

The team confirmed that Skyline College offers degree programs that are focused in at least one area of inquiry or "major" that culminate in 38 associate degree programs, 24 associate degrees for transfer (ADTs), one Bachelor of Science degree, and 56 certificate programs. The CORs exemplify the compliance with standards laid out in Title 5, Section 55002 (full description of the course and its components) The baccalaureate degree also requires study in a focused area or major in addition to the upper division general education courses, as evidenced by the college catalog and the website for the program. (II.A.13)

The team confirmed that Skyline College ensures that students earning career-technical certificates and degrees demonstrate technical and professional competency through internal and external processes. Internally, the biannual review of CTE programs ensures currency and relevancy of programs, while external exams and area licensures, where applicable, also validate programmatic learning. (II.A.14)

The Bachelor's in Science in Respiratory Care processes for review are similar to those detailed for the other programs and certificates with regard to helping students demonstrate appropriate

technical and professional competencies. Course Outlines of Record for the BSRC include as an expected learning outcome the ability to demonstrate the technical and professional competency required by a licensing or certifying agency. The credentialing exam is administered by the National Board for Respiratory Care, and the curriculum competencies for the courses are influenced by the metrics set for CoARC, which is an external accrediting body for the program. (II.A.14)

The team confirmed that the Annual Program Plan and the Comprehensive Program Review cycles provide for regular evaluation and improvement of the quality and currency of all instructional programs. PRIE, Planning, Research, and Institutional Effectiveness, participates by providing data for review, and this data informs the analysis and plans. The outcome of the process shows communication of these analyses to the deans and vice presidents, who prioritize resource needs for review by the appropriate committee (Faculty FTE Committee, Instructional Equipment Committee, or the Executive Leadership Team), which make resource allocation recommendations to the President. The team reviewed evidence indicating an agreed-upon process for program modification and discontinuation, should the analysis determine that is necessary. Board Policy 6.13 provides authority and evidences process for providing significant programmatic changes or discontinuance (II.A.15) The Bachelor's in Science in Respiratory Care follows the same processes. (II.A.15, II.A.16)

# Conclusions:

The institution meets the Standard. The Bachelors in Science in Respiratory Care also meets the Standard.

# **IIB.** Library and Learning Support Services

# General Observations

During a campus tour, the team observed the Learning Commons, which provides multiple tutorial labs, an assistive technology center as part of the Disability Resource Center, and library services to support student learning and achievement. The team interviewed several managers from the Learning Commons who demonstrated passion and equity in service to all students and faculty. The team also reviewed the collaboration the College has with the Peninsula Library System and found this to be an expansive learning support for students.

# Findings and Evidence

The team confirmed that the institution assesses the effectiveness of its library and learning support services in terms of quantity, quality, depth, and variety in multiple ways. One assessment method includes having librarians engage in an ongoing process of collection evaluation. This process includes consideration of the publication date and the currency of the information maintained in the collection. The team confirmed the Library utilizes the Annual Program Plan (APP) and Comprehensive Program Review (CPR) processes to continually evaluate its program effectiveness and this was further validated during interview with Library and Learning Center staff. Evaluations of services also include input from faculty, staff, and students through the use of student and faculty surveys evidenced by review of survey results. (II.B.1, II.B.3)

The team confirmed the institution supports student learning and achievement by providing over 230,000 e-books, 55,000 print books, a partnership with Peninsula Library System (PLS), which provides access to a consortium of 35 public and community college libraries, and research databases covering social sciences, humanities, natural sciences, law, business, and current events. (II.B.1, II.B.4)

The team toured the Learning Center, which offers a Disability Resource Center with an Assistive Technology Lab, the Veterans Resource Center, and the MESA Lab. To support students in the Bachelor's in Science in Respiratory Care program, a simulation lab is provided for their use. The team confirmed that Library usage is tracked through a system called Accudemia and helps guide decision making as evidenced by the teams review of Accudemia summary reports. The team further validated, during interviews with Library and Learning Center staff, the Dean of Academic Support and Learning Technologies, the Director of the Learning Commons, and the Learning Center Manager that continuous improvement and evaluation occurs on a weekly basis to improve service to students and measure impact of services on student achievement, rather than just usage of services. (II.B.2)

Lastly, the team confirmed during interviews with Library and Learning Center staff, that the Library participates in developing Institutional Learning Outcomes that led to the development of embedded librarian modules in ENG 105/100 as evidenced by Institutional Service-Learning Assessments and the Library Annual Program Plan. (II.B.3)

# Conclusions:

The College meets the Standard. The College also meets the Standard for the Bachelor's in Science in Respiratory Care.

# **IIC. Student Support Services**

# **General Observations**

During the visit the team toured the Student Support Services departments and observed services being provided to students. The team visited multiple spaces that are available to students. The areas included tutorial labs, counseling, mental health and wellness, and other support areas demonstrated commitment to providing an inclusive and welcoming learning environment for all students.

Team members interviewed staff from financial aid, counseling, and veteran student workers in the Veterans Resource Center, who all confirmed a strong commitment and level of passion that is reflected in the daily work of student services personnel to provide a student-ready institution rather than expecting students to be college ready. Student Services personnel spoke about the current process of implementing Salesforce, a new system that will provide technology support for better student tracking, early alert referrals, text functionalities, and student success teams. The counselors interviewed by the team also spoke to the importance of providing the same level of training for part-time counselors as for full-time counselors to ensure accurate and consistent information and advising for all students. The student services personnel interviewed by the team also validated the participation and role student services personnel have had in the development of the Skyline College Comprehensive Redesign. Students interviewed by the team validated that access to resources is prioritized by the College and decisions are made with students in mind.

### Findings and Evidence

The team confirmed that the institution regularly evaluates the quality of student support services and demonstrates that these services, regardless of location or means of delivery, including distance education and correspondence education, support student learning, and enhance accomplishment of the mission of the institution. (II.C.1)

Student Services departments use the Annual Program Plan (APP) and Comprehensive Program Review (CPR) processes, which the team confirmed by reviewing program reviews available on the Program Review webpage, and information collected from the Community College Summary of Student Engagement (CCSSE) survey administered in fall 2016. It was confirmed by the team that results from the CSSE survey led to support for the Zero Textbook Cost (ZTC) initiative. during interviews with the Dean of Counseling and Matriculation and counselors, it was also confirmed that student surveys are completed for counseling program SLOs and used to improve services. It was also through student feedback and a result of program evaluation that led to the development of the College Promise Scholars Program. (II.C.1, II.C.2)

The team confirmed that the institution ensures equitable access to all of its students after reviewing multiple program reviews of student services areas, a chart of student support services by delivery method, and the new organizational structure which includes an addition of the Student Equity and Support Services Division, which directly ties to the Mission, Vision, and Values. To support the new Bachelor's in Science in Respiratory Care program, the team confirmed that support services are provided with a portion of a dedicated counselor, portion of a dedicated librarian, and embedded tutors which was validated during an interview with the Dean of Science, Math, and Technology, the Head of Respiratory Care, and the Counselor dedicated to the program. (II.C.3)

The team confirmed that the College's co-curricular and athletic programs are suited to the institution's mission and contribute to social and cultural dimensions of the educational experience. The students interviewed validated that they participate on College committees and their voices are heard. The students spoke of changes made institutionally regarding prices of lunch options and potential student housing opportunities because of the feedback students provided administration. (II.C.4)

The team also visited the Center for Student Life during a campus tour and received flyers for co-curricular activities taking place on campus. The team also reviewed the board policies and administrative regulations governing athletic programs, as well as reviewed the Statement of Compliance of Title IX Gender Equity and Equity in Athletics Data Analysis reports. (II.C.4)

After review of the College's counseling website, counseling annual program plan, and counseling comprehensive program review, the team confirmed that the institution provides

counseling and/or academic advising programs to support student development and success. Interviews with counselors and the Dean of Counseling and Matriculation validated that professional development is prioritized for counseling faculty, including adjunct faculty, to ensure counselors are kept up to date with transfer/academic requirements, that they disseminate accurate information in a timely manner, and every counselor participates in bi-weekly meetings/trainings. (II.C.5)

The team confirmed through reviews of the catalog and multiple San Mateo County Community College District board policies and administrative regulations that the institution has adopted and adheres to admission policies consistent with its mission that specify the qualifications of students appropriate for its programs. In addition to counseling and advising services, the institution provides clear steps to enrollment on the webpage and in the catalog as well as information regarding a clear pathway to completion of educational objectives. During a meeting with the Dean of Science, Math, and Technology and the Head of Respiratory Care, additional academic advising documents specific to the Bachelors in Science in Respiratory Care were provided to the team further validating the clarity in requirements to achieve the baccalaureate degree. (II.C.6)

The team confirmed that the institution regularly evaluates admissions and placement instruments to validate their effectiveness while minimizing bias. The team reviewed the 2016-17 and 2017-18 Annual Program Plans and the 2018-2019 Comprehensive Program Review for Admissions and Records, the Assessment Center Program Student Learning Outcome Results, and interviewed counseling staff regarding placement. The College is following the new requirements in California under AB-705, which requires students to be placed directly into transfer level coursework their first semester, or be placed into a sequence of math and English courses that will allow the student to complete transfer level coursework within one-year timeframe. During an interview with the Dean of Counseling and Matriculation and several counselors, the team confirmed that assessment tools are still being used for specific populations of students to guide placement if English is not their first language or AB-705 criteria do not apply. The team confirmed that validation assessments were last completed during the 2017-2018 academic year and are planned to evaluate the effectiveness of the new placement process. The team also confirmed that training was provided to counselors, who are responsible for placement and advising, to ensure consistency. (II.C.7)

The team confirmed the institution maintains student records permanently, securely, and confidentially, and publishes and follows established policies for release of student records as evidenced by review of SMCCCD administrative procedures, the district employee handbook, the loyalty oath required by all staff working with student data, the FERPA release form, and the information in the catalog regarding release of information. The team also confirmed the College's commitment to data security by reviewing the Information Technology Department's Strategic Plan, as well as an agreement SMCCCD has with Iron Mountain, the company which hosts the backup files at an off-site location. (II.C.8)

# Conclusions:

The College meets the Standard.

The College also meets the Standard including for the Bachelor's in Science in Respiratory Care.

### **Standard III. Resources**

### **IIIA. Human Resources**

### **General Observations**

With the assistance of the District's Office of Human Resources, the College employs and maintains a sufficient number of administrators, faculty and classified staff to achieve its mission and improve academic quality and institutional effectiveness. The College has a well-defined process for the selection of faculty, management, and classified positions. The institution ensures the integrity and quality of its programs and services by employing administrators, faculty and staff who are qualified by appropriate education, training, and experience to provide and support these programs and services. The College has various methods for providing professional development opportunities to all classifications of employees. They have documented policies and procedures for all aspects of Human Resources management. The Board subscribes to principles of human resource management that promote equal access, equal employment opportunity, equal treatment and fairness, staff development and training opportunities, and fair compensation and accountability.

### Findings and Evidence

The team confirmed that the College ensures the integrity and quality of its programs and services by employing qualified administrators, faculty and staff. This is demonstrated by established and well-defined Board Policies and Hiring Procedures for administrators, faculty and classified staff. (III.A.1)

The College works closely with Human Resources to advertise openings and attract eligible applicants. This was further confirmed by interviews with the Human Resource Director who clarified the college's role in the recruitment process. In addition, the team reviewed the Hiring Procedures for all levels of faculty and staff hiring. Human Resources strategically advertises to a broad community of applicants via several venues in an effort to ensure diversity of the hiring pool. (III.A.1.)

The team reviewed the Minimum Qualification Handbook and Board Policy 3.05, to confirm the institution demonstrated that it has a process to verify the qualifications of applicants and newly hired personnel. Per review of the online application, applicants are required to answer questions to demonstrate they meet the position requirements. Applicant qualifications are further verified by a second review of the application conducted by the screening committee. As evidenced by Board Policy 3.05, there is a detailed equivalency process to further ensure faculty qualifications. (III.A.1)

During an interview with the Human Resource Director, the team confirmed the equivalency process for foreign transcripts. The District Human Resources department requires that Foreign Education completed outside of the United States be submitted for equivalency review in order for courses to be considered for the satisfaction of minimum qualifications. Foreign transcripts are translated and evaluated by a U.S.-based credentials evaluation service. The District currently accepts evaluations from agencies approved by the California Commission on Teacher

Credentialing. A sample of a former evaluated foreign transcript was provided for the team to review. (III.A.1)

In collaboration with the District Human Resources Department, Skyline College adheres to policies and procedures to ensure the qualifications for each position are closely matched to specific programmatic needs and that the employment of individuals who are qualified and have the appropriate education, training, and experience meet job performance expectations and standards. Following the College's and District's approval process for filling a new or vacant position, Human Resources works closely with the hiring manager to draft a position announcement that accurately details the qualifications, duties and responsibilities for the position in support of program needs. This is evidenced by the ISER, job descriptions and confirmation with the Human Resource Director. (III.A.1)

The team was able to confirm that the College ensures that all job descriptions are directly related to the institutional mission. Once the mission-related needs are defined, the screening committee ensures that key components, including duties and qualifications, are established for the job announcement. The team verified during interviews with the Strategic Planning and Resource Committee representatives that the criteria, qualifications, and procedures for selection of personnel address the needs of the institution in serving its student population. (III.A.1)

The team reviewed Faculty Screening Procedures, to confirm that the college demonstrates that it has a consistent process to verify that faculty selected for hire have adequate and appropriate knowledge of their subject matter and requisite skill. Qualifications are verified via degrees, professional experience, discipline expertise, teaching skills, and curriculum development. Per review of the Minimum Qualification Handbook, Administrative Procedure 3.05 and the Faculty Selection Procedures, the college ensures faculty are hired according to minimum qualifications, equivalency, Title 5 regulations and licensure. Job announcements for all positions including courses in the baccalaureate degree program have a special general statement about the position duties and responsibilities as well as desirable skills and abilities. Faculty qualifications for teaching courses in the baccalaureate degree comply with the Baccalaureate Degree Pilot Program Handbook published by the California Community College Chancellor's Office. (III.A.2.)

The team confirmed that the College has a formal process for vetting credentials and other forms of preparation to ensure that qualified faculty are selected. During review of Administrative Procedures 3.15 (Faculty Hiring), applicant qualifications are verified via a screening committee with a secondary review conducted by Human Resource staff. All faculty job descriptions include the responsibility for curriculum oversight and student learning outcomes. Upon reviewing faculty job descriptions and a current tenured faculty job posting via the District website. Faculty are required to assist in curriculum revisions and new course development, department planning, and program review. Faculty are required to participate, on an ongoing basis in the assessment and analysis of student learning. (III.A.2)

The institution demonstrates that it has a process to determine if administrators and other employees responsible for educational programs and services possess the qualifications necessary to perform duties required to sustain institutional effectiveness and academic quality.

The team confirmed that the Administrative and Classified Selection Procedures, Faculty Screening Procedures and the CSEA contract are used to determine that the College follows guidelines and procedures to ensure that Administrators and Classified staff meet required minimum qualifications. With the assistance of Human Resource staff, the candidate's degrees, work experience and qualifications are verified before appointment of the position. (III.A.3)

The team confirmed that the College verifies the qualifications of applicants and newly hired personnel. Initially, a screening committee verifies the qualifications of applicants, followed by a secondary review by the Human Resources Department. The team confirmed that the official transcripts are required prior to any employees starting their assignment. It was confirmed during a meeting with the Human Resource Director that full-time faculty transcripts are kept on file at the District Office. Part-time faculty transcripts are kept on file at the College in various offices. New faculty members hired with equivalency for minimum qualifications are required to submit an application and supporting documentation in accordance with Administrative Procedure 3.05.1. (III.A.4)

Through the assistance of HR, the College has a systematic process to ensure that all personnel evaluations lead to improvement of job performance. Per the District website, there are well-defined evaluation procedures for management, faculty, and classified. The procedures provide specific guidelines pertaining to purpose, frequency and appeal process. During an interview with the Human Resource Director, the team confirmed that the evaluation process for all personnel is tracked with documentation stored at the District office. (III.A.5)

The team confirmed that all personnel, full-time and part-time, are evaluated on a regular basis and in accordance with the contracts between the District and bargaining units. During an interview with the Human Resource Director, the team learned that the evaluation process for all personnel is tracked with documentation stored at the District office. (III.A.5)

Through interviews with college and district administrators, the team confirmed that the evaluation criteria accurately measure the effectiveness of all personnel in performing their duties. The College values the evaluation process as a way to recognize employee achievements, evaluate job progress, and design relevant trainings for performance improvement and skill development or refinement. It is also an opportunity to clarify expectations, review prior performance goals and identify new goals for performance. (III.A.5)

This standard is no longer applicable or relevant, effective January 2018. (III.A.6)

The team confirmed that the College has the appropriate staffing levels for each program and service. During interviews with academic and student service deans, they shared they have a sufficient number of qualified fulltime and part-time faculty. Many personnel could attest to the growth of tenured track positions in several divisions, primarily Counseling, Science, Math and Technology, including faculty teaching courses in the baccalaureate program, Social Science and Creative Arts. The value for levels of personnel was communicated in various meetings and open forum. There is a commitment for each division to have at least one tenured faculty. (III.A.7)

Through several interviews with appropriate staff, the team confirmed that the College has established policies and practices designed for the orientation, training and evaluation of parttime and adjunct faculty. Per meetings with the academic and student services deans, faculty leadership and the Skyline College Comprehensive Redesign Team, the team confirmed that new and continuing adjunct faculty are encouraged to participate in a variety of robust activities offered through the Center for Transformative Teaching and Learning. Annually, CTTL offers the Adjunct Faculty Teaching Symposium as well as Flex day activities. The College ensures adjunct faculty participate in conferences, workshops, seminars and trainings. Faculty are invited to participate in several online and in person training opportunities. (III.A.8)

The team confirmed that the College has the appropriate staffing levels for each program and service. During interviews with academic and student service deans, the College demonstrated that it has a sufficient number of qualified support personnel. The team confirmed that the College uses the Human Resources Plan along with the Program Review process to determine staffing needs in support of program and strategic goals. Through an integrated budget and planning process, the College has a systematic process for addressing staffing needs. (III.A.9)

The team confirmed that the College has the appropriate staffing levels for each program and service. During interviews with academic and student service deans, the College expressed a sufficient number of qualified administrators. In review of the Human Resources Plan along with the Administrative Leadership Unit Reviews, the team confirmed that the College maintains a sufficient number of administrators to provide continuity and effective leadership and services that support the mission. (III.A.10)

The team also confirmed through a review of the Board Policy 2.08 that the College, in conjunction with Human Resources, establishes, publishes and adheres to written personnel policies and procedures that are available for information and review. (III.A.11)

In a review of prior minutes from meetings of the District Participatory Governance Council, the team confirmed that the policies and procedures are fair and equitably and consistently administered. It is the responsibility of the DPGC to review the board polices on an as needed bases for additional revisions. During interviews with the academic and student services deans the team learned that the review process involves vetting the reviewed policies and procedures locally at each college, followed with feedback for revisions reported back to the district wide committee. (III.A.11)

The institution's policies and practices promote an understanding of equity and diversity. The College strongly emphasizes the importance of supporting and embracing diversity in its mission statement and in Board Policies and Administrative Procedures 2.01. In review of prior board meeting minutes, the team learned that the Board adopted an Affirmation of Commitment to Social Justice, with a core principle of valuing and promoting diversity. During interviews with campus constituents, the team confirmed the institution's commitment to ensuring diverse and equitable employment while upholding its mission; this is etched into the fiber of the institution

and is demonstrated by its adherence to the District's Equal Employment Plan. The college promotes a just, equitable and inclusive environment and is committed to hiring personnel that embody the same philosophy. The College is committed to the recruitment of a diverse team. In meeting with the Human Resources Director, the team confirmed that, in collaboration with the district, the College creates inclusive hiring practices for all employee positions and is to be commended for its strong focus on diversity and equity, aligning hiring with its institutional mission and goals. (III.A.12)

The team confirmed that the institution has methods to determine the kinds of support its personnel need and regularly evaluates the effectiveness of these programs and services. The College provides a variety of resources, programs, and services to support the training needs of its diverse employees. Through the Stewardship for Equity, Equal Employment and Diversity Advisory Committee (SEEED) and the Student Equity and Support Programs (SESP) Division, the team discovered that formalized training program via the Equity Training Series is offered to all interested personnel to attend a six week course to discuss the components of social justice and equity. In addition, all personnel are encouraged to participate in the Equity Institute held each spring and the Equity Academy offered in the fall. (III.A.12)

The institution tracks and evaluates its record on employment diversity and equity. The District Human Resources Department periodically assesses information on employment equity and diversity for all District personnel and annually certifies to the state its compliance with equal employment opportunity regulations. (III.A.12)

The team confirmed that personnel are treated fairly. The team reviewed Board Policy 2.21, and learned that the intent is that all District employees are required to adhere to the highest ethical standards in pursuing the College's and District's mission of providing quality educational programs and in managing resources efficiently and effectively. The District policies and procedures describe ethical standards as a commitment to the public good, accountability to the public, and commitment beyond the minimum requirements of the law. Each employee group has prepared a distinct Code of Professional Ethics for their respective constituencies, which, as a whole, comprise the Districtwide Policy on Ethical Behavior adopted by the Board. (III.A.12)

The team confirmed that the college plans for the recruitment of diverse personnel in accordance with its mission. In terms of hiring, Skyline College is an equal opportunity employer and adheres to the hiring processes defined in Board Policy 2.20 regarding Equal Employment Opportunity. The College includes the Equal Employment Opportunity policy in all job announcements and ensures a highly diverse selection committee membership. During interviews with the academic and student services deans, the team learned that all screening committees are charged with selecting candidates who demonstrate sensitivity and ability to work with students and persons from diverse backgrounds. The College is committed to have all job applicants provide a diversity statement in which they convey their commitment to embracing the diverse community that Skyline College serves, as well as describe how they incorporate diversity into their work. (III.A.12)

During a review of Board Policy 2.21 (Professional Ethics) the team learned that the College has an approved ethics policy for all of its personnel, which delineates consequences for violation.

Although Board Policy 2.21 does not include a process to address violations of the ethics policy, the collective bargaining agreements address the progressive disciplinary procedures for all classifications, including tenured faculty. (III.A.13)

The team confirmed that the institution plans for and offers commendable professional development opportunities consistent with the college's deep commitment to equity and the college's mission. Skyline College provides a variety of resources, programs, and services to support the training needs of its diverse employees. Through the Stewardship for Equity, Equal Employment and Diversity Advisory Committee (SEEED) and the Student Equity and Support Programs (SESP) Division, the team discovered that formalized training program via the Equity Training Series, Equity Institute and Equity Summit. Ensuring that equity and social justice permeates the campus community, personnel are encouraged to participate and advance equity centered work throughout the campus. (III.A.14)

The team confirmed that the College has various methods for providing professional development opportunities to all classifications of employees. They have documented policies and procedures for all aspects of Human Resources management. The Board subscribes to principles of human resource management that promote equal access, equal employment opportunity, equal treatment and fairness, staff development and training opportunities, and fair compensation and accountability. (III.A.14)

The team confirmed that the college engages in meaningful evaluation of professional development activities and uses results for improvement. In collaboration with the District, the college ensures its personnel participate in professional development opportunities on topics including, but not limited to, hiring committee training, unconscious bias, benefits of diversity and Title IX. The College has established a professional development academy via the Center for Transformative Teaching and Learning that provides a series of on-campus opportunities for all faculty and staff. (III.A.14.3)

During interviews with Institutional Effectiveness and Integrated Planning colleagues, the team confirmed that the college measures the impact of professional development activities on the improvement of teaching and learning. The College, along with the District assesses professional development opportunities for all employee groups that are consistent with the institutional mission and strategic goals. (III.A.14)

The team confirmed that College has provisions for keeping personnel records secure and confidential. Per Board Policy 2.12, the team verified that the District ensures that all personnel records, whether paper or electronic, are maintained in a secure and confidential manner by keeping records in a securely locked area. Access to electronic files is strictly limited. In review of Board Policy 2.12, the team was able to verify that the institution provides employees access to their records. (III.A.15)

# Conclusion:

The College meets the standard. The College meets the standards for the Bachelor's in Science in Respiratory Care.

### **IIIB. Physical Resources**

### **General Observations**

During interviews with campus safety, groups of administrators and faculty, and a campus tour, the team validated that the institution ensures safe and sufficient physical resources at all locations where it offers courses, programs, and learning support services. Safety, security, and a healthy learning environment are embodied in the culture of the College, which prioritizes emergency preparedness for the entire campus community and operates with the dignity of the student at the forefront.

Skyline College does an exceptional job providing professional development opportunities around emergency preparedness by having maintenance and custodial staff first aid trained, holding monthly drills on different emergency situations, and taking a proactive approach to handling Title IX and student conduct issues.

The institution also ensures that planning of new facilities directly align to the Mission, Vision, and Values of the College and undergo a thorough process for total cost of ownership.

### Findings and Evidence

The team reviewed multiple board policies and administrative regulations and confirmed the College ensures that all activities on and off campus are safe. Facilities, maintenance, and operations staff support the College by ensuring access, safety, security, and an optimal environment for learning and working, which was further validated during a meeting with the Chief of Campus Safety and Director of Student Support. (III.B.1)

A Health, Safety, and Emergency Preparedness Committee meets monthly to proactively focus on campus safety functions including reviewing campus construction activities and employee safety improvement recommendations and was validated during a meeting the Chief of Campus Safety. The District Safety Committee meets every quarter to discuss all District safety-related matters. The team confirmed that information is made available to the entire campus community on process and procedures for reporting unsafe physical features. (III.B.1)

The team confirmed that the Annual Program Plans (APPs), Comprehensive Program Reviews (CPRs), and Administrative Leadership Unit Reviews (ALURs) are used to prioritize projects and inform the District Facilities Master PlanThe team confirmed through meetings with the Dean of Science, Math, and Technology that the Bachelor's in Science in Respiratory Care program began as a hybrid program; however, after retention and success evaluations were conducted, the College transitioned the program to be fully online and continues to fully invest in the program through technology and dedicated support services. As building projects are implemented, logistics and campus impacts are discussed at the Capital Improvement Program (CIP) meetings as evidenced by meeting agendas and further validated in a meeting with the Chief of Campus Safety. (III.B.2, III.B.3)

The team confirmed that physical resource requests are addressed through the Annual Program Plan (APP), Comprehensive Program Review (CPR), and Administrative Leadership Unit Review (ALUR) processes and are required to go through a Total Cost of Ownership assessment with an

emphasis on maximizing energy savings by using the Green Building Council's Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (LEED) certification standards. This process was further validated during a meeting with the Academic and Student Services Deans. (III.B.4)

### Conclusions:

The College meets the Standard. The College also meets the Standard for the Bachelors in Science in Respiratory Care.

# **IIIC. Technology Resources**

### **General Observations**

The maintenance and acquisition of technology resources at Skyline College are the responsibility of both the college and the District. Some technology is local, and some is shared to capitalize on economy of scale within the 3-college district and remove barriers from students who may be shared among the colleges. The responsibility for IT services is also shared between the college and the district, and they utilize a tiered ticket system: requests are submitted and assigned a level (1-4) based on severity or complication. Levels 1-2 are dealt with at the college, and levels 3-4 are dealt with at the district level.

The team confirmed that IT Services are comprehensive, and the Skyline Technology Plan (2018-2022) and SMCCD Technology Plan (2019-2024) both outline respective missions, parameters of services, policies, and ways in which college and district working units cooperatively share responsibilities and resources. All facilities, including the Bay Area Entrepreneur Center (BAEC) located in downtown San Bruno, are connected to college and district resources.

# Findings and Evidence

The team confirmed that there is organizational structure in place to support the technology resources required to adequately execute the MVV of Skyline College. Reading the local and district Technology plans confirmed the adequacy and propriety of the technology resources and levels of support available to maintain operations. All programs, including the Bachelor in science in Respiratory Care, receive adequate technology and support to effectively carry out their programs. The team confirmed campus participation and input through the monthly Technology Advisory Committee (TAC), which brings forward ideas with regard to new technology. (III.C.1, III.C.2)

The District IT plan provides evidence that campus technology standards are established by incorporating input from the College, ensuring that any updates and replacement of technology meets current instructional and end-user needs. The team verified a 5-year replacement schedule for instructional labs, 4-year schedule for faculty, and a 4-year replacement schedule for smart classrooms. The team also verified that through the APP, CPR, and ALUR processes, faculty, staff, and administration may recommend hardware and software that align with local goals. (III.C.2)

The team confirmed security and maintenance of the IT systems is operational at Skyline College. The college maintains a backup generator to ensure the continued working of systems if necessary, and it also maintains a series of instructional servers located throughout the campus and off-site at BAEC for necessary redundancy. The team verified that daily backups occur on all administrative data, and district ITS has a comprehensive backup strategy to ensure that no data is lost. (III.C.3)

Exploration of both the district and college IT webpages demonstrate the commitment to technology instruction and support. Both sites house links to training and support for learning various educational and systems software to the fullest. An example of Skyline's technology instruction and support was observed in visiting the Center for Transformative Teaching and Learning (CTTL) One room for faculty innovation, called the "Learning Space" has a green screen wall as well as a "Wall Talker" wall where faculty can reserve time in 10-minute increments and with the assistance of Classified Professionals in the area can make videos to embed in their online classes. (III.C.4)

Finally, the team confirmed that there are policies in place to guide student, faculty, and staff use (BP 2.34); computer and network use (BP 2.34-201304); use of district communication systems (BP 2.35-201305); access to district email (AP 2.35.1); use of student email (BP 2.36); computer use policies for students (website); and college use of technology in the classroom (website). (III.C.5)

<u>Conclusions:</u> The institution meets the Standard.

# **IIID. Financial Resources**

# **General Observations**

Skyline College uses an integrated planning and resource allocation model for financial planning, resource allocations, and to address financial obligations. The planning process provides campus-wide participation opportunities ensuring that all constituents, including students, participate in setting priorities in support of the college mission. The District is considered basic aid; and therefore, it is self-supporting, relying on operating revenue from local property taxes rather than State apportionment. With careful and prudent financial planning the District and College ensures both short-term and long-term financial stability and solvency. The College has established policies and procedures, regulations, and accepted accounting practices. The College has maintained a significant reserve level that exceeds state mandates of 5%. Third party audits show the District and College adhere to prudent financial management standards resulting in no material findings nor audit adjustments within the past five years. The Board of Trustees is appropriately engaged in financial matters and ensures the administration and college meets its financial obligations.

# Findings and Evidence

The institution has sufficient revenues to support educational improvement and innovation. The College has various funding sources, including local property tax revenues, student tuition fees,

the Education Protection Account (Proposition 30 and 55), Lottery funds (proposition 20), proceeds from the dissolution of California Redevelopment Agencies, and interest income. The District has more resources than it would normally receive as a revenue limit district and is no longer subject to the State's budgetary constraints for general apportionment resources. Thus, the financial resources of Skyline College are sufficient to support learning programs and services, including the baccalaureate degree program and to improve institutional effectiveness. The team was able to verify the fiscal solvency of the District and College as evidenced by the FY1920 Adopted Budget Report and financial statements for FY1718.

College Funds are allocated in a manner that will realistically achieve the institution's stated goals for student learning. This was evidenced by reviewing the FY1920 Adopted Budget Report and meeting with the College's Budget, finance and Integrated Planning team. Financial resources are sufficient to support and sustain student learning programs and services and improve institutional effectiveness. (III.D.1)

The College ensures that line items in the budget for resources support student learning programs and services. The team confirmed the budgeting priorities per meeting minutes from the Strategic Planning and Resource Committee (SPARC). In recent meetings SPARC members are discussing budget scenarios in alignment with the college mission. The distribution of resources supports the development, maintenance, allocation and reallocation, and enhancement of programs and services. (III.D.1)

The institution's resource allocation process provides a means for setting priorities for funding institutional improvements. The College receives funding for the implementation of the priorities set in the various campus and district plans through the resource allocation model. The team was able to confirm that the financial resources of Skyline College are sufficient to support learning programs and services and to improve institutional effectiveness. This was evidence by the Education Master Plan, District Strategic Plan, and District Facilities Master Plan. Institutional resources are carefully managed to sustain student learning programs and services and improve institutional effectiveness. This was evidence by the Education Master Plan and College Human Resources Plan: Staffing for Student Success. College leadership is intentional about in their efforts to sustain effective learning programs and services in alignment with the college mission. (III.D.1)

The team confirmed that the College reviews its mission and goals as part of the annual fiscal planning process. The Skyline College Mission, Vision and Values (MVV) statement is the basis that guides selection and prioritization for financial planning and ensures that financial planning supports and is integrated in a fundamental way. The MVV is formally reviewed by the College in support of decision making. This was evidenced by the Education Master Plan which provides key strategic direction for College goals that guide financial planning and decision making. The institution establishes priorities among competing needs so that it can predict future funding. The team confirmed that institutional plans exist, and they are clearly linked to financial plans, both short-term and long-range. Personnel requests, funding allocations, facilities improvement, and technology purchases are initiated using this program review process. In meeting with the Vice President of Administrative Services and Finance and Operations Manager, the team

discovered that program review is the primary mechanism for identifying specific areas of need or opportunity. (III.D.2)

The financial planning process relies primarily on institutional plans for content and timelines. The team was able to confirm that planning drives the budget. The College uses an integrated planning and resource allocation model for financial planning, resource allocations, and to address financial obligations. The College provided evidence that the budget is based on Annual and Comprehensive Program Review plans and aligned with the Colleges Educational Master plan. (III.D.2)

The team confirmed that the governing board and other institutional leadership receive information about fiscal planning that demonstrates its links to institutional planning. The College President and Administrators regularly present enrollment, instructional, financial and operational information to key constituents and decision-making bodies through the governance processes, committees, working groups, and general communications. Budget details are also shared via SPARC, Academic Senate and other committees. The College provides SPARC meeting updates in the campus newsletter, Skyline Shine. College leadership presents a new orientation, Budget 101, and review of the college budget to the SPARC participatory governance committee. Committee members share the information with their constituents, and related documents are posted to the College's public website.

The College uses an integrated planning and resource allocation model for financial planning, resource allocations, and to address financial obligations. The team verified that the College budget process ties resource allocation to planning and program review. Institutional plans (Annual and Comprehensive) exist and are clearly linked to financial plans, both short-term and long-range. Personnel requests, funding allocations, facilities improvement, and technology purchases are initiated using this program review process. Personnel requests, funding allocations, facilities improvement, and technology purchases are initiated using this program review process. (III.D.2)

The College budget assumptions are tied to the mission, institutional goals, or program. The team confirmed that the institution's mission and goals are the foundation for financial planning, and financial planning is integrated with and supports all institutional planning. The institution has policies and procedures to ensure sound financial practices and financial stability. Appropriate financial information is disseminated throughout the institution in a timely manner. (III.D.2)

The Team confirmed that the institution has established processes for financial planning and budget development, which are widely known and understood by college constituents. The College leadership regularly presents enrollment, instructional, financial and operational information to key constituents and decision-making bodies through the governance processes, committees, working groups, and general communications. Budget details are also shared via SPARC, Academic Senate and other committees. The College provides SPARC meeting updates in the campus newsletter, Skyline Shine. College leadership presents a new orientation, Budget 101, and review of the college budget to the SPARC participatory governance committee. Committee members share the information with their constituents, and related documents are posted to the College's public website. (III.D.3)

The College's Integrated Planning and Resource Allocation Model is used to ensure constituent participation in financial planning and budget development. Through various campus division meetings, shared governance committees, Academic Senate, Classified Senate and Student Leadership, the team verified that the College encourages participation from all campus stakeholders in an effort to support and sustain student learning programs and services and improve institutional effectiveness. The team verified that the College has many opportunities to inform and involve the college community in financial planning and budget development. This was evidenced by SPARC meeting minutes, Budget 101 report outs, and committee updates via the Skyline Shine. (III.D.3)

The team confirmed that College and District constituents involved in institutional planning receive accurate information about available funds, including the annual budget showing ongoing and anticipated fiscal commitments. Locally, the College makes a concerted effort to communicate budget updates accurate and timely as well as ensure there is sufficient representation on college and districtwide committees. In meetings with shared governance committees, the team confirmed that the College President and Administration regularly present enrollment, instructional, financial and operational information to key constituencies and decision-making bodies through the governance processes, committees, working groups, and general communications. It was very clear to the team that two-way communication between all constituent groups and leadership was fluid throughout the campus. Budget information is presented to the SPARC and committee members deliver information to their stakeholders and gather input from their constituencies. (III.D.4)

Considering the college has wide constituent representation on several college and district committees, budget information, including the institution's fiscal condition, is sufficient in content and timing to support realistic institutional and financial planning. The team confirmed through interviews with committee participants (SPARC, Academic Senate, College Governance Council, and District Participatory Governance Council) that the Institutional planning at Skyline College reflects realistic assessment of financial resources availability, development of financial resources, partnerships and expenditures requirements. The team verified that the annual budget calendar provides the timeline for components of the budgeting and integrated planning process. Three-year financial projections provided by the district further allow the college opportunities to timely forecast allocations and expenditures. (III.D.4)

The College has been fiscally prudent and continues to operate with a balanced budget that includes a stable reserve. The College continues to seek other sources of funding through federal, state and private grants in alignment with the mission, vision and values. Through sound financial planning, including a realistic expectation of financial resource availability, the team verified that financial information is readily available allowing planning to realistically reflect available resources. (III.D.4)

The team confirmed through a review of materials prepared by committees, such as SPARC, that the College is actively engaged in planning and prioritizing resource allocations in alignment

with college goals. College leadership regularly communicates projected and actual revenue and expenses information to support informed fiscal decision making. During recent SPARC meetings, members reviewed prior year budget suggestions while considering current financial scenarios that will have lasting future implications. (III.D.4)

Skyline College ensures the financial integrity of the institution and ensure responsible and appropriate use of financial resources through a variety of internal control mechanisms. During interviews with College leadership, the team learned that the District's College Internal Audit Group (CIAG) conducts varied types of internal audits, evaluates the effectiveness and efficiency of business process, monitors internal controls and systems, and identifies opportunities for improvement. The team confirmed the College Office of Administrative Services role in approving all journal entries and requisitions. In addition, managers regularly review and approve expenditures, journals, and requisitions for their areas of responsibility. (III.D.5)

Through interviews with staff in the Office of Administrative Services, Academic and Student Services Deans and SPARC representatives, the team was able to confirm that college stakeholders are informed about the budget, fiscal conditions, and financial planning. The team verified that the College has many opportunities to inform and involve the college community in financial planning and budget development. This was evidenced by SPARC meeting minutes, Budget 101 report outs, committee updates via the Skyline Shine. (III.D.5)

Skyline College provided evidence that college constituents are actively involved in institutional planning and management and receive dependable and timely information about available funds. The team was able to verify the Annual Budget reports showing ongoing and anticipated fiscal commitments. (III.D.5)

The College provided evidence in the form of the FY1920 Final Budget and 2018 Financial Audit Statements verifying that information, including the fiscal condition, financial planning, and audit results, is sufficient in content and timing to support sound financial management. The review of the Final Budget and Financial Statements is evidence of a balanced budget that reflects the priorities and reinforces the core values of the College and District. The 2018 Financial Audit Statements confirmed that the institution prepares accurate financial documents through the application and maintenance of adequate internal controls. The District engages the services of its external auditors to conduct annual interim audits during which internal control processes are evaluated. (III.D.5)

College funds are allocated, as shown in the budget, and are an accurate reflection of institutional spending. During review of the Final Budget Report, the team confirmed that institutional spending is a reflection of appropriate allocation of resources to support stated goals for student learning. (III.D.6)

During meetings with the Office of Administrative Services, Faculty and Classified representatives of SPARC and Academic and Student Services Deans, the team discovered that the institutional budget is an accurate reflection of institutional spending and it has credibility with constituents. (III.D.6)

College information about budget, fiscal conditions, and audit results are provided throughout the college. During interviews with College leadership, the team learned that the District's College Internal Audit Group (CIAG) conducts varied types of internal audits, including external audits, which are communicated appropriately via college shared governance committees. In review of the Financial Audit Statements, the team was able to confirm the details of the comprehensive audits, inclusive of district funds, student financial aid, bookstore, and Associated Students funds. (III.D.7)

The Integrated District Budget Planning Calendar was reviewed as evidence that the institution remediates audit findings in a timely manner. The District responds per the outlined timelines to the audit findings promptly and as a result has not had any repeat or material findings in the last five years. (III.D.7)

The College provided audit findings for the last six years. The District responds per the outlined timelines to the audit findings promptly and as a result has not had any repeat or material findings in the last five years. However, the FY1314 audit findings pertained to recommendations cited in regards to State General Apportionment Funding System. More specifically, there were discrepancies between the FY1314 Annual 320 report and supporting course details, resulting in an overstatement of FTES reported in the 320 report. The team was able to confirm that the finding was clarified and addressed in a timely manner. The Finance Department regularly conducts program review, including evaluation of effectiveness of internal controls. During interviews with College leadership, the team learned that the District's College Internal Audit Group (CIAG) is integral to ensuring that internal controls are maintained for all District fiscal processes. (III.D.7, III.D.8)

The College and District assess the effectiveness of its past financial plans and the results of this assessment are used to improve current and future financial plans. This is evidenced by The Integrated District Budget Planning Calendar which details the budget development process. Included in the calendar is consultation with the District Committee for Budget and Finance, which is a subcommittee of the District Participatory Governance Council in matters relating to finance. The calendar provides timelines for planning, discussions and decisions by the Board, and concludes with adoption of the Final Budget. (III.D.8)

The team confirmed that College annual audits demonstrate the integrity of financial management practices. This was evidenced by review of the Financial Audit Statements for the last six years. The audit examines the district-wide financial management processes and provides recommendations to improve financial processes, internal controls and accountability. This includes review of special fund expenditures, such as grant and categorical funds. The College reviews its internal control systems on a regular basis. The team confirmed that CIAG is integral to ensuring that internal controls are regularly reviewed at the District and College level. For example, the CIAG may review the Cashier Office's operation and make recommendations to improve cash handling procedures. (III.D.8)

The team confirmed that the College has a sufficient level of unrestricted fiscal reserves to meet financial emergencies and unforeseen occurrences. This was evidence by the FY1819 Final Budget Report. (III.D.9)

The District and College ending balances for general unrestricted funds for the immediate past three years is sufficient to maintain a reserve to meet its needs and unforeseen emergencies. The College provided a copy of the FY1819 Final Budget Report as supporting evidence of cash flow and reserves. To further ensure financial stability, the Board directed staff to increase reserves to 13 percent which is well above the state recommended level of 5 percent. (III.D.9)

The District monitors risk regularly to ensure appropriate levels of insurance coverage per institution by conducting actuarial studies. The College provided a copy of the FY1819 Final Budget Report as supporting evidence of sufficient insurance to cover its needs or emergencies. The team was able to verify that the District's insurance coverage includes employee, property, casualty, and liability insurance as well as state approved self-insured workers' compensation. (III.D.9)

The College and District's process for receiving revenues does not pose cash-flow difficulties. The team confirmed per the Final Budget Report that the District maintains sufficient cash flow to fund District operations prior to the receipt of property tax revenues. This was further evidenced by quarterly reports to the Board of Trustees.

The team confirmed that the College has established processes to assess its use of financial resources. During interviews with the Office of Administrative Services, it was confirmed that the College provides appropriate oversight of finances through monitoring and provision of regular financial reports to managers for a variety of funding sources, including grants and categorical. The Associated Students of Skyline College (ASSC) accounts are maintained by the College of Administrative Services. The ASSC funds are also reported in the Final Budget report. (III.D.10)

The College provided evidence that it demonstrates compliance with Federal Title IV regulations and requirements for managing federal financial aid. The team was able to verify the College's Cohort Default Rate Analysis Report from 2010 to 2018, thus confirming the college default rate to be less than 15 percent. The team was also able to confirm that the College and District maintain compliance with federal Title IV rules and regulations through annual reviews, including external audits. Most recent audit findings related to Title IV indicate no findings. The Office of Administrative Services works in conjunction with the College Financial Aid and District to ensure state and federal guidelines are in compliance. (III.D.10)

The team confirmed that the College ensures that it assesses its use of financial resources systematically and effectively. During interviews with the Office of Administrative Services, the team also confirmed that the College and District provide appropriate oversight of all finances, including management of financial aid, grants, contractual relationships, foundation funds, institutional investments and Measure H bond funds. (III.D.10)

The College uses results of prior audits and reviews as the basis for improvement. This is evidenced by several updates to college shared governance committees, district participatory committees and Board of Trustee meetings, detailing financial resources, expenditures, and state and federal reports. The College provided the Final Budget Report, committee meeting minutes and board agendas as further evidence. (III.D.10)

The College continually assesses and adjusts its capital structure and cash management strategies to ensure both short-term and long-term financial solvency. The team confirmed through interviews with staff in the Office of Administrative Services and SPARC that the District provides three-year projections. This allows the College, through shared governance committees, to review multi-year projections as part of the integrated planning process in an effort to provide timely information for financial planning. The team confirmed that planning is guided by the College MVV, Education Master Plan, Technology Plan, Human Resource Plan, District Strategic Plan and Facilities Master Plan and Program Review. (III.D.11)

The team confirmed that the District provides leadership in planning for payments of long-term liabilities and obligations, including health benefits, insurance costs, building maintenance costs, and pension rate increases. This was evidenced by review of the Resource Allocation Budget Scenarios. The team confirmed that the District considers short-term and long-term needs annually during budget development. (III.D.11)

The District uses prudent fiscal management practices to identify and plan for long-term liabilities and obligations. The District uses an actuarial study to determine overall liability for Other Post-Employment Benefit (OPEB) obligations. (III.D.12)

The College's pension and OPEB plans are sufficiently funded. The College provided prior Financial Audit Statements as evidence of \$12.2 million deposited by District into the OPEB irrevocable trust. The actuarially determined OPEB liability as of June 30, 2018 is funded at 95 percent. (III.D.12)

The team confirmed that the College and District have an annual assessment of debt repayment obligations. The District uses a debt service fund to account for the accumulation of resources for, and the payment of, general long-term debt. Bond Committee Oversight meeting minutes were provided as evidence. For example, residents of San Mateo County voted in favor of Measure H, the \$388 million bond measure, which includes the Skyline College Environmental Studies Building. These funds were tracked by a fund number with frequent updates and review at the Bond Oversight Committee. (III.D.13)

The team confirmed that the District uses a debt service fund to account for the accumulation of resources for, and the payment of, general long-term debt. As evidenced by Bond Oversight Committee meeting minutes, the team confirmed that the District has appropriate plans to repay locally incurred debt through the use of assessed property taxes to pay off the general obligation of bond Measure H. The District has a high level of integrity for the use of and repayment of these funds. (III.D.13)

As evidenced by Board Policy 8.06, the District ensures that the locally incurred debt repayment schedule does not have an adverse impact on meeting all current and future financial obligations. The team was able to confirm that the District uses a conservative yet flexible approach to deploy cash funds in various types of investment portfolios as detailed in the Final Budget Report. (III.D.13)

The team verified that College annual audits demonstrate the integrity of financial management practices. This was evidenced by review of the Financial Audit Statements for the last six years. The audit examines the district-wide financial management processes and provides recommendations to improve financial processes, internal controls and accountability. This includes review of restricted fund expenditures, such as grant and categorical funds. College expenditures from restricted funds, including state categorical or grant funds, are made in a manner consistent with the intent and requirements of the funding source. The team was able to verify during meetings with the College Office of Administrative Services that financial resources are managed and tracked by their respective budget codes in the Banner system. The tracking system allows managers to monitor funds for their intended purpose, review expenditures, and use the data for state reporting. (III.D.14.2)

The District exercises due diligence of bond expenditures and is consistent with regulatory and legal restrictions. This is evidenced by Financial Summaries of bond expenditures. The team confirmed that the Bond Oversight Committee provides regular expenditure updates for all constituents to review each quarter. The College and District ensure ongoing review and management of the financial operations of all auxiliary activities. The team verified that auxiliary funds undergo external audits to ensure funds are used with integrity in a manner consistent with the intended purpose of the funding source. (III.D.14)

Federal student financial aid revenue and disbursements are monitored to ensure compliance with federal requirements. The team reviewed the College's 2010 to 2018 Cohort Default Rate Analysis Report to confirm the College's default rate of less than 15 percent and within the federal guidelines. The team has confirmed that the College has a plan to reduce the default rate if it exceeds federal guidelines by creating and implementing a default management plan. (III.D.15)

The team confirmed that student loan default rates, revenues streams, and assets are monitored and assessed to ensure compliance with federal regulations. The College and District ensure internal audits are provided regularly to ensure federal compliance. Contractual agreements with external entities are consistent with institutional mission and goals. During meetings with the College Office of Administrative Services, the team was able to verify the process for external contract agreements requires several levels of review and approval by the appropriate Dean, Vice President and President prior to submitting agreements for District and Board approval and execution. (III.D.16)

The team confirmed that the College has a systematic process for external contractual agreements. Per Board Policy 8.03 the College and District maintain control over all contracts with provisions to terminate contracts. The team was able to verify that the College's external contracts and agreements are managed in a manner to ensure that federal guidelines are met. The District reviews all contracts to assess risk and ensure proper insurance requirements are met. (III.D.16.3)

Conclusion: The College meets the Standard.

## Standard IV. Leadership and Governance

## **IVA. Decision-Making Roles & Processes**

#### **General Observations**

Skyline College's culture reflects a deep commitment to the interrelated themes of social justice and equity—themes voiced by students, faculty, administrators and staff throughout the institution. Institutional leadership fosters innovation around these themes through development of strategic planning documents, reorganization and creation of new divisions, dedicated funding, and multiple sources of communication. Innovation and excellence are also supported through effective participatory governance structures, professional learning opportunities, and reflective assessment of programs, initiatives, and participatory governance processes. Institutional policies and procedures describe the roles of each group in committees involving governance, planning and budget development, curriculum, and other educational matters.

#### Findings and Evidence

Institutional leadership was instrumental in developing the college's strategic planning documents, which provide a framework and context for the values and vision that encourage both innovation and excellence at Skyline College. These documents highlight a deep and ongoing commitment to equity, from the Comprehensive Diversity Framework, first published in 2013, to the Skyline College Comprehensive Redesign beginning in 2016. The first design principle of the Diversity Framework is equity. (IV.A.1)

Institutional leadership, including faculty, staff, and administration, has developed close community and business partnerships to advance innovative practices at the college. These include local business sponsorship of an "Interview Closet" to provide clothing for students interviewing for jobs; the development of an apprenticeship program with the food services at Google, where students apprentice four days a week and work toward their Skyline degrees on Fridays and weekends; a four-day training program of Skyline computer science instructors at Apple to develop curriculum for a coding course; and a burgeoning dual-enrollment initiative that projects to involve 1,800 local high school students in Skyline College courses. Notable in this effort is the equity-minded orientation of leadership, identifying and supporting the unique needs of each constituent group--including students, high school instructors, and Skyline faculty. Interviews with the dean of Strategic Partnerships and Workforce Development revealed deliberate decisions to seek partnerships with local businesses to partner with the college are tied to equity principles: there is a minimum "living wage" threshold companies must meet to recruit at on-campus events. (IV.A.1)

The institution's equity-oriented hiring practices foster innovation and a multiplicity of voices among employees. A review of the College's Human Resources Plan includes an entire section on Equity and Excellence in Hiring and Retention. A formalized process of recruiting with an equity lens contributes to an employee base that will generate new ideas originating from a wide range of experiences and backgrounds. (IV.A.1)

The team confirmed that students, faculty and staff are active on participatory governance committees. Interviews with students, faculty, and administrators confirm the important role participatory governance plays in the regular business of the college. Students in the Associated Students of Skyline College (ASSC) named committees they participated on as student representatives and described their roles in communicating with and representing their constituencies and affirmed that they felt their perspectives were heard and helped shape action. The team also confirmed that students are compensated to sit on participatory governance committees, demonstrating the College's commitment to inclusion. Representatives from the Academic Senate affirmed their role in participatory governance as well, noting its own changing practices in response to many new external and internal factors. Administrators noted that the College Governance Council (CGC) and the Strategic Planning and Allocation of Resources Committee (SPARC)--both part of participatory governance--do play a role in supporting the direction of the college. (IV.A.1, IV.A.2, IV.A.5)

Some discretionary funding supports new or innovative efforts; the team reviewed documents that indicate that SPARC reviews and hears presentations from each group engaged in Comprehensive Program Review and makes recommendations to the CGC for funding. The President's Innovation Fund exists specifically to support initiative, creativity, and innovation. A wide range of initiatives were awarded in 2018, from Foster Youth support to art projects to high school outreach/inreach to financing literacy efforts and more. (IV.A.1)

The team reviewed the Skyline College Annual Report and the Scorecard to confirm that both document the year's achievements, both quantitatively and qualitatively. A weekly publication of the campus newsletter *Skyline Shines* showcases work and initiatives of various members of the campus community. (IV.A.1)

The team reviewed Board policies that stipulate specific memberships and member roles for a range of participatory governance committees, including the College Governance Council (CGC), Strategic Planning and Allocation of Resources Committee (SPARC), Stewardship for Equity, and Equal Employment and Diversity (SEEED), and over a dozen others. The District Participatory Governance Committee reviews board policies, procedures, district budgeting, planning processes, and processes and procedures for hiring. Similar policies were reviewed by the team that describe the responsibilities and authority of the Academic Senate, the Senate's Curriculum Committee, the Educational Policy Committee, and the Professional Personnel Committee. (IV.A.2, IV.A.3,IV.A.5)

The team observed that Board Policy 2.05 affirms the Academic Senate as the representative body for making recommendations to the Board regarding academic and professional matters. As a standing committee of the Academic Senate, the Curriculum Committee approves new and revised curriculum to assure compliance with Title V and Education Code regulations. Division faculty representatives--including those for the Bachelor in Science in Respiratory Care--have seats on the Curriculum committee. Other standing committees of the Academic Senate include The Educational Policy Committee--which considers for recommendation all educational policy matters related to academic standards, including those for the Baccalaureate Degree and the Professional Personnel Committee, which chiefly recommends faculty development programs. (IV.A.4)

The team found that the Participatory Governance Evaluation Survey is the principal means for regularly evaluating Board policies and procedures related to governance committees; the team reviewed the results from the 2018 survey. Due to transitions in the Planning, Research and Institutional Effectiveness (PRIE) office, creation of an action plan in response to the survey is underway. The PRIE office also conducted the Employee Voice Survey in 2018, and the team found that, while there were no direct questions about policies and procedures of governance committees and structures, general feedback about the efficacy of participatory governance was provided. (IV.A.4)

Skyline College's recognition of the need for diverse perspectives in the shaping of its priorities is strongly evidenced in its Comprehensive Diversity Framework for Realizing Equity and Excellence, a foundational document in the college's planning which dates back to 2013 in its original form and is still referenced today. The team reviewed the college's early work on multiple measures and Guided Pathways and noted the broad range of constituent groups on the Design Team, which is the principal planning group for the Comprehensive College Redesign. (IV.A.5)

The team confirmed that clear channels are established for communicating decision-making processes and decisions from major participatory governance groups. The team reviewed bylaws, membership rosters, agendas, and meeting minutes on the college website for the Academic Senate, the Classified Senate, the Associated Students of Skyline College (ASSC), and the College Governance Council. In interviews, members of these groups affirmed their responsibility to their constituents and communities. (IV.A.6)

During the teams review of the ISER the team found that there were no recent self-evaluations by participatory governance groups. However, during the peer review visit the team learned that a President's Work Group now exists to manage participatory governance group evaluations. This group will review the Compendium of Committees and make recommendations on consolidation, revision, or elimination of governance committees. In addition, the PRIE office will conduct a follow-up survey on participatory governance in the fall of 2019 and share results with CGC, Strategic Planning and Allocation of Resources Committee (SPARC), Classified and Academic Senates, as well as the ASSC to inform decisions about any changes or action plans that are required. Interviews with some governance groups suggest that more regular formal self-evaluations may lead to closing the loop on major action items, so that constituent groups are fully informed about the outcomes of governance groups. (IV.A.7)

## **Conclusion**

The College meets the Standard. The College also meets the Standard for the Bachelor's in Science in Respiratory Care.

# **IVB.** Chief Executive Officer

#### **General Observations**

The Skyline President has steered the campus toward equity and social justice innovations that permeate the campus--especially in areas of instruction and student services. The President spreads the College's mission through robust planning--as well as the thoughtful use of resources. The President's Innovation Funds have sparked changes at Skyline and appear to have improved the success of students in impressive ways. A spirit of innovation, which can be directly related to the President's leadership, is evident throughout the College.

#### Findings and Evidence

The Skyline President communicates institutional values, goals, and standards through several major planning documents, including the Education Master Plan, the Technology Plan, the Comprehensive Diversity Framework for Realizing Equity and Excellence. The visiting team confirmed during interviews with multiple Deans and the Executive Director of the Equity Institute that the President has worked with the Stewardship for Equity, Equal Employment and Diversity (SEEED) Committee to establish the Comprehensive Diversity Framework for Realizing Equity and Excellence, which has influenced instruction in important ways, including pedagogical strategies and educational materials. Multiple Deans and the Executive Director of the Equity Institute further confirmed that the President demonstrates direct leadership in selecting and developing personnel by meeting with each of the screening committees. (IV.B.1)

During interviews, several Deans confirmed that a high-powered equity lens informs practicebased professional development for faculty, staff, and administration. Skyline holds equity trainings to which faculty, staff, and students are invited; some of the trainings are required, and administrators, faculty, and staff along with students emphatically attested to the value and importance of these trainings. The focus on social justice is part of the fabric of the college, and the President has supported important ways to reach members on the campus on this subject. Deans and Directors also confirmed that the President delegates authority to the appropriate administrative staff. (IV.B.1, IV.B.2)

The Director of Community Relations and Marketing confirmed that much of the information that shines forth from the weekly college newsletter, Skyline Shines, comes from recommendations of the President. The President works with multiple campus groups and advises them to share information through the newsletter, which is available on the website. (IV.B.1)

Another example of the President communicating values, goals, and standards to a specialized group of internal stakeholders is the annual leadership retreat, at which the President leads the team in developing and adopting the Leadership Standards of Excellence, which were subsequently incorporated into the administrative evaluation processes. (IV.B.1)

At the behest of the President, data on equity has been used to promote activities to improve student success and learning. One such training activity was on "Decolonizing Your Syllabus." Faculty and the Director of Equity confirmed that Stewardship for Equity, Equal Employment and Diversity (SEEED) and the Equity Institute have "revolutionized the classroom." Strategies have been put into practice to have a student ready campus, instead of fixating on the idea of students being ready for college. In interviews with members of the Redesign and Pathways Group, the team learned that the College had to come to terms with what came to be known as the "Brutal Truths," hard facts regarding student persistence rates, years to attain a degree, achieve transfer, or earn a certificate, as well as the number of units students were attempting and completing. The President has stood behind communication and funding to foster new developments connected to pedagogy and support services and counseling--along with other equity practices--all of which have improved student success. (IV.B.1)

The team interviewed members of the Stewardship for Equity, Equal Employment and Diversity (SEEED) Committee, Deans, and Directors, and confirmed that the President has used allocation and planning processes to influence the institutional teaching and learning environment to improve student equity, access, and success. The President relies on the Office of Planning, Research and Institutional Effectiveness (PRIE) to shape planning and decision-making processes at the College. The President has directed the Dean of Planning Research and Institutional Effectiveness to serve as the Accreditation Liaison Officer. (IV.B.3, IV.B.4)

The team interviewed Deans and Directors to confirm that accreditation items are regularly on the cabinet meeting agenda and that the President provides direction to the executive team who reaches out to the entire College about accreditation. Under the President's leadership, Accreditation Standards surface in the participatory governance processes, and the President supports the training of several College faculty, staff and administrators to participate in ACCJC trainings. (IV.B.4)

The team reviewed Board meeting minutes to confirm the President's attendance and participation at Board meetings, and the President meets weekly with the Chancellor's Cabinet. The Skyline President communicates statutory and compliance expectations to the Board through the Chancellor. In addition, during interviews with Deans the team confirmed the President's commitment to implementing statutes, regulations, and policies and following practices that mesh with Skyline's Mission, Vision, and Values. (IV.B.5)

## Conclusion:

The College meets the Standards.

# **IVC. Governing Board**

## General Observations

The governing board has developed and published a comprehensive set of by-laws, policies and operating procedures consistent with the district mission to ensure the quality, integrity, and improvement of student learning programs and services and the resources necessary to support them. The board participates in ongoing professional development and regularly reviews key indicators of student learning and achievement and plans for improving academic quality.

The ISER and its evidentiary links make clear that the Board provides appropriate foundational by-laws, policies, and procedures to support the district's mission and responsibility to ensure

quality educational programs for students. The Board delegates key authority to the Chancellor to carry forth its will within the district. The Board also has established proper evaluative structures to assess its own performance and the Chancellor's in reaching performance goals.

## Findings and Evidence

The Board of Trustees conducts a self-evaluation each year that reflects the Board's opinion that trustees are adhering to the philosophy statement and to each of the code of ethics statements regarding collective action. Trustees are careful to assess whether Board actions align with the District policies and mission. While the Board does not always vote unanimously to support the administration's recommendations, Trustees accept and support the decision of the majority. The Board of Trustees' BP 1.10.1 delineates its responsibilities for providing "policy guidelines for staff through adoption and periodic review of District Mission and Goals Statement;" to exercise oversight and policy related to fiscal health and stability of the district and the monitoring of institutional performance and quality; and to "periodically review Board policies consistent with the goals and operation of the District and its Colleges." BP 1.10.2 describes a range of responsibilities in representing the public interest in the operation of the district. BP 1.34 notes Board members are bound by approved Board policies, and that Board members shall work and communicate through appropriate channels of authority and responsibility. (IV.C.1, IV.C.2)

The Board has created clear policies and procedures for the search, selection and evaluation of the district chancellor and stipulates that the Board is to evaluate the Chancellor annually using a process developed with the agreement of the Chancellor. BP 2.03 articulates policy for the search, selection, and an annual evaluation of the college president. (IV.C.3)

To ensure it represents the public interest, the board has a policy requiring it to represent the public interest. In addition, as verified in meeting minutes, the board provides opportunity at each public meeting for members of the public to comment on issues not covered on the agenda. Meeting agendas are posted to the district's public website. In addition, BP 1.35 and 2.45 articulate clear conflict of interest policies governing board members. The Board composition reflects public interest in the institution, including a student representative policy created in 2017 that moved the Board away from an at-large election to one in which each member represents a distinct area of the county. (IV.C.4)

Policies and goals governing the board's expectations for quality, integrity and improvement of student learning programs and services begin with the district's Mission Statement. Subsequent policy describes the board's responsibilities in broad functional areas related to those expectations. Meeting minutes indicate the board regularly monitors and reviews a district data dashboard--along with the state's Student Success Scorecard and IEPI Framework indicators--for key metrics related to the strategic plan and institution-set standards--data that informs their discussions about the district's progress and student success. Review of board minutes also indicates that fiscal integrity is monitored through quarterly financial statements and reports from the District's Finance Office, and that independent, external audits are conducted regularly to verify that the District's policies, procedures, and internal controls are effective. (IV.C.5, IV.C.8)

The team confirmed that Board policies related to its size, duties, responsibilities, structure, and operating procedures are comprehensive and readily available on the Board Policies & Procedures section of the district board's website. (IV.C.6)

The Board provides minutes recording discussions held and actions taken. A team review of records indicate that the Board conforms to its own policies and bylaws. The Board timeline for reviewing its policies for currency, relevance, and purpose is every six years. The Board has also outlined in Board Policy 2.08 the role of the District Participatory Governance Council (DPGC) to assist in reviewing policy matters. (IV.C.7)

Board policy provides a detailed description of training and orientation for new board members, and calls for ongoing professional learning for all board members. The board regularly sends representatives to the Community College League of California's annual policy conference, and they subscribe to the League's Board Policy and Administrative Procedure Service, which provides ongoing information about emerging issues and policy development. The board conducts frequent study sessions focusing on a single topic. Board study session minutes indicate topics have included bookstore operations, strategic plan updates, and College Promise. The board also received training about the accreditation process and Accreditation Standards, Eligibility Requirements, and Commission policies as part of a study session in July of 2019. The board has staggered terms of office, ensuring board continuity; collectively, the current board members have nearly 65 years of service on the board. (IV.C.9, IV.C.13)

Board Policy related to Board member conduct, illustrates the process for Board evaluation of itself on a yearly basis in order to identify areas that provide room for improvement, as well as strengths that can be built on. The Board develops its self-evaluation criteria and reports self-evaluation results to the public. (IV.C.10)

The Board has also established policies and procedures addressing potential conflicts of interest that members may have. The Board has also established a code of ethics for members' performance and conduct. Processes are in place to deal with conflicts of interest and other questionable ethical matters. Every year, Board members fill out financial disclosures to ensure transparency in matters of economic interests. (IV.C.11)

The Board delegates administrative authority to the Chancellor, whose main responsibility is leading educational programs, as well as general business procedures. The Board partners with the Chancellor to establish yearly performance goals for evaluation. (IV.C.12)

<u>Conclusions</u> The College meets the Standards.

## **IVD. Multi-College Districts or Systems**

#### Evidence of Meeting the Standard

The team confirmed that the District participates in a number of assessments of its effectiveness including a District Office Program Review to obtain feedback on District services. The Office of General Services coordinates this effort, with each functional leader being responsible for their respective departments. The Chancellor's staff reviews and shares the results, communicating feedback to the respective area of responsibility.

In addition, the District ensures the participation of appropriate members of District and College constituencies in decision-making through the DPGC. Each year, the DPGC reviews the policy and the effectiveness of the group's work and recommends changes to the policy as needed. Information discussed in the DPGC is widely shared with the various stakeholder groups across the District.

# **Quality Focus Essay**

During a three-year effort Skyline College faculty, staff, administration, and students developed a *Comprehensive Diversity Framework* in 2013, demonstrating the College's commitment to social justice and academic excellence. The College used this framework to take stock of its programming and services and identify barriers to student success. This process of self-study and reflection resulted in the launch of the Skyline College Comprehensive Redesign in 2016. The three "signature components" of the improvement plan the College chose to highlight in the QFE are:

- 1. Meta Majors and Guided Pathways
- 2. Transformative Teaching and Learning
- 3. Promise Scholars Program (PSP)

#### Meta Majors and Guided Pathways

Over the past two years, the members of the College's Design Team has facilitated workshops, flex day activities, campus forums, campus-wide division meetings, work team meetings, and student focus groups to establish a foundation for the Meta Major work. Through this multi-year college-wide process, Skyline College has made significant progress creating components of Guided Pathways: Meta Majors, intentional course sequences, and aligning student success milestones to progress through completion.

These Meta Majors include; Arts, Languages, & Communication; Business, Entrepreneurship, and Management; Science, Technology, and Health; and Society and Education. These Meta Majors were designed and named by incorporating student feedback into the process. Intentional course sequences were designed by instructional and counseling faculty, with career counselors contributing student development benchmarks, so as to support navigation toward completion.

Structures are now in place and the College recognizes the need to focus on the implementation, campus-wide, of these efforts. The action plan for the next stage includes mapping courses into intentional course sequences to better guide students, design communications materials to inform students about Meta Majors, and create assessment and evaluation plans to gauge the progress of these efforts.

#### Transformative Teaching and Learning

The College is committed to a Comprehensive College Redesign. The focus is on the responsibility of every employee to help create and support an institutional culture that is reflective and inclusive, engages a listening stance, and practices critical inquiry. The College Community believes that no matter what position an employee has on campus, an opportunity for teaching and learning is present. The College defines transformative teaching and learning as "embracing the limitless potential of all learners in a co-creative, relevant, and innovative environment that fosters curiosity and critical thinking and gives space to lived historical and cultural identities to change lives and communities."

The redesign efforts include the development and incorporation of curriculum bundling, assessment methods, and campus-wide pedagogical practices that will inform transformative interactions between all employees and students, while providing all learners the context for making relevance and meaning of their educational experience. To achieve this, the College created a number of inquiry teams to investigate, recommend, and help implement transformative teaching and learning practices.

Finally, the Center for Transformative Teaching and Learning (CTTL) will lead the College through campus-wide professional development efforts to ensure the institutionalization of the transformative practices researched and developed by the work teams. The Student Equity and Support Programs Division (SESP) will further support this *signature component* through its semester-long Equity Training Series where faculty, staff and administrators convene monthly for training and action-research to both increase consciousness of biases due to race, gender and class, as well as to promote a more equitable campus culture.

## Promise Scholars Program (PSP)

The third are of focus for Skyline College is to address issues that impact students' ability to access, enter, progress, and successfully achieve their educational goals. The College studied an array of innovative initiatives in higher education, and eventually chose to replicate City University of New York (CUNY) highly successful *Accelerated Study in Associate Programs* (ASAP) as a way of improving completion by reducing key financial barriers and redesigning counseling and guidance systems.

In fall 2016 Skyline College began to pilot the ASAP model within the existing culture and structure of the College, calling the initiative the PSP. Students in the first cohort received focused counseling support, a scholarship for one full year of tuition, free textbooks through the library, and fee waivers to reduce college expenses. The College brought the replication to scale in 2017-2018, adding workshops on topics such as careers and career benchmarks, navigating school, and socioemotional aspects affecting achievement like resilience, motivation, and grit. The PSP reached full replication status in fall 2018, with a director and eight counselors (part time and full-time) hired, and 507 Promise Scholars enrolled. Promise Scholars now receive financial support consisting of up to three years of fee waivers, textbook vouchers, and monthly transportation incentives. Promise Scholars also receive priority registration, blocked GE courses, required tutoring for students experiencing challenges in their academic coursework, and dedicated counselors with small caseloads in both 1-to-1 and group counseling session formats, based on a tiered support model. The College aspires to build a highly impactful program whose success will allow for further fundraising and eventual expansion to all students.

## Anticipated Outcomes

The College anticipates that the three components of the Comprehensive Redesign may have a far-reaching impact on student learning and achievement. The combined effect of Meta Majors and Guided Pathways, Transformative Teaching and Learning, and the Promise Scholars Program is to enhance student learning, increase overall completion rates, reduce time to completion, and reduce equity gaps in student achievement. Improvements are expected to be

gradual, but steady, with the first changes to improve course success rates, and show a significant reduction of equity gaps taking at least several years.

The peer review team believes that the College has created a realistic timeline for review of progress towards completing project goals. The Quality Focus Essay, illustrates the College's commitment to improve success and completion with equity and social justice as core components. All three areas of focus will include the efforts of faculty, administrators, staff and students. Key roles for these groups to work collaboratively have been identified with appropriate goals to complete the process.