2018-19 Business Comprehensive Program Review

I.A.   **Program Purpose**

Describe the purpose of the program and how it contributes to the mission of Skyline College.

Narrative

The Business Department focuses on providing skills for students to succeed in both the business and entrepreneurship career pathways. In addition, courses provide students specific skills to be successful in specialized careers.

The Business Department echo's Skyline College's mission by empowering a global community of learners through the creation and revision of certificates, creating and revising courses and banking or deleting courses that do meet Skyline College's Mission, Skyline College's Promise and industry standards.

The main goals of the program align with Skyline College's strategic plan:

1) Provide excellent and innovative instruction by highly qualified faculty to prepare students for transfer, AS degrees, certificates and success in business and entrepreneurship career pathways and/or personal growth.

2) To create a culture of 21st century pedagogy that aims to disrupt traditional learning in line with current business practices. This should include both pedagogy and the environment in which we teach to enhance student success and enhance cultural competence. . The Business department continues to expand online/hybrid courses and programs and having fully online certificates.

3) Provide new opportunities for students to engage in emerging sectors and career pathways through the creation of certificates that align with California's "Doing What Matters" initiatives. Provide meaningful professional development to students with engaging speaker series and workshops lead by industry professionals and business site visits to leading corporations.

4) To address the needs of workforce, business and industry. Business has a strong Advisory Board and strong connections with the Bay Area Entrepreneurship Center (BAEC). Business has strong connections working with strong workforce.

I.B. **Program Student Learning Outcomes**

List the current program student learning outcomes (PSLOs).

Narrative

- Critical Thinking - Apply critical thinking and analytical skills in decision making and problem solving.
- Accounting/Financial Accounting - Understand and apply accounting principles to prepare financial statements.
- Business Law - Develop an understanding of the law and the legal environment as it relates to business operations, including its ethical implications.
- Intro to Business Information Systems - Identify the basics of information technology and apply software applications to enhance efficiency of business functions.
- Business Communications - Create effective oral and written business communications utilizing modern communication technologies.
- Economics/Macroeconomics - Demonstrate knowledge of basic economic concepts and how they affect business.

I.C.   **Profile: Program Review Team**
Comprehensive program review is intended to be a collaborative process which promotes dialogue and reflection. Please identify all individuals who contributed to or shaped the program review narrative. Include names and the title or role of each person.

Narrative
Christine Roumbanis-Dean of BEPP

Soledad McCarthy-Associate Professor Business

Grace Beltran-Adjunct Instructor Business

II.A.   **Program Effectiveness**

Review data related to the program and assess the program's effectiveness at meeting its described purpose. Consider using college-wide data for comparison purposes. Program data may

- Standard program review reports from PRIE including indicators of success, retention, and equity
- Program-specific data such as labor market data, surveys, and custom reports
- Program Student Learning Outcome (PSLO) reports from TracDat
- Prior CPR/APPs
- Feedback from the program's administrator, advisory committees, and/or other stakeholders
- Course outlines of record and offering history (instructional programs only)
- Professional development received
- Other relevant data
- Additional data may be requested from PRIE by completing the Research Request Form available at http://www.skylinecollege.edu/prie/request.php

Based on the data reviewed, describe the overall effectiveness of the program and any conclusions drawn from the data

Narrative

After examining student characteristics, the department found some interesting data from 2013-2014 to 2017-2018. Enrollment (unduplicated headcount) in Business has steadily declined for five years from a high of 1,714 enrollment in 2013-2014 to 1,155 students in 2017-2018. This is a decrease of 559 students over the five year period. A comparison between Spring 2018=552 students and Spring 2019=599 students indicates an increase of 47 students. We anticipate this enrollment trend will continue. We believe this increase is occurring because of program marketing. The gender breakdown in 2017-2018 was 52% Males, 45.1% Females and 2.4% unreported. 6.9% more Males are enrolled in Business courses. The number of females is increasing, in 2015-2016 there were 43.7% females which is a 1.4% increase. The College-wide Gender breakdown is 52.3% Females, 44.9% Males and 2.8% unreported. Historically, the Business field has been very male dominated, which is indicated in having more males than females. Yet the 6.9% spread between male and female students indicates the success of our female outreach of hiring female faculty members and providing opportunities for female entrepreneur guest speakers in our Business classes.

The College-wide and Business Headcount by Ethnicity breakdown is in alignment with our local community which parallels the college data. In 2017-2018, Asian students accounted for 22.8% and Multi-Race students accounted for 18.3%. Pilipino students accounted for 15.8%. Black - Non-Hispanic students decreased from 55 students in 2017 to 39 students in 2018. We intend to perform targeted outreach to Black - Non-Hispanic students through existing partnerships with high schools, new high school partnerships and participation in on campus events. Students between the ages of 18-22 make up 52.5% of our enrollment. This is 7.6% higher than the college average. Also, the data indicates that 82.7% of Business students stated goal is to obtain a Degree/Transfer. This is 18.2% higher than the College-wide general population average of 64.5%. Business is a very popular major in colleges as well as

the Business AS-T Transfer Degree. There are many opportunities for Business degree holders to work their way up into management positions and their earning potential is generally much higher than other occupations.

After reviewing student outcomes data from 2013-2014 to 2017-2018 in Business, we are pleased with the increases in success and retention rates and with the decreases in withdrawal rates. Success rates increased from 67.7% to 72.9% (5.2% increase), which is below the College-wide success rate of 74.6%. Retention rates increased from 80.7% to 85.6%, a 4.9% increase, which is below the College-wide retention rate of 87.3%. Withdrawal rates decreased from 19.3% to 14.4% (4.9% decrease), which is higher than the College-wide retention rate of 12.7%. The data results weren't surprising since Business faculty have been committed to professional development opportunities attending workshops and flex day activities to learn new pedagogical and technological instruction methods. The outcome is faculty have increased knowledge of best practices, collaboration and reflection leading to increased success and retention rates, engagement with students, and lower withdrawal rates. This is a main goal of the Business faculty leading to student success for all students. Total enrollments for Business (not including Summer) from 2013-2014 to 2017-2018 decreased from 2,267 to 1,345 students. College-wide enrollment has decreased as well.

Productivity: The LOAD for Business from 2013-2014 to 2017-2018 increased from 440 to 480 over this five year period. The LOAD in 2018-2019 increased Fall 2018=512 and Spring 2019=513. The goal of the Department is to continue efforts to increase LOAD to reach the College goal of 525. The Department has worked on course efficiency and increasing our online/hybrid course delivery options. All our Business classes are offered in online/hybrid and face-to-face so there is flexibility in scheduling to meet student's needs. Business faculty both full-time and part-time are encouraged to attend professional development workshops learning updated pedagogy and alternative assessment to aid with student success and retention.

After reviewing the data, the Business program is continuously effectively meeting program objectives and the mission-vision-values of the College. We are committed to creating quality open access Business programs, focusing on student success and retention, and we encourage full and part time faculty to attend professional development activities learning updated pedagogy for 21st Century learners. We have work to do, but Business is on the right track increasing LOAD, success and retention and decreasing the number of withdrawals. We strive for student success so students achieve their educational goals on time.

II.A.1   **Progress on Prior Program Objectives (Goals)**

Describe the progress made on prior CPR/APP objectives including identification of achievements or areas in which further effort is needed. If the program is new with no prior CPR/APP, comment on new program implementation.

Below the narrative box, use the Associate Objectives feature to select the related objectives. Once associated, you may also view each objective. If appropriate, edit the status to Completed or Discontinued.

Narrative

Our previous APP focused on the following four goals Launching and Promoting the New Entrepreneurial Certificates, SLOAC Assessment Increasing Faculty Participation, Support Faculty Development and Skyline Promise Initiative (guided pathways). This year we are continuing with the goals and added a few more.

1. **Focused on Launching and Promoting the New Certificates.** We collaborated with the Small Business Deputy Sector Navigator and received an $18,000 grant to develop, promote and launch our Entrepreneurial Certificates. We hosted a series of workshops and invited industry professionals to speak to students about entrepreneurship opportunities and skills needed to be successful in their businesses. We are hosting "Changing the Face of Entrepreneurship Business Expo Week" April 2019. This is a series of entrepreneurial workshops which includes successful speakers from industry. The week also includes a vendor fair where Skyline students are given the ability to launch their businesses as well as collaboration with the Cosmetology Department. The Business Department is in the process of creating a Human Resources Management Certificate and a Sales and Marketing Certificate.

2. **Emphasized SLOAC Assessment Methodologies with the Aim of Increasing Faculty Participation.** All coordinators went through TracDat training and held a workshop at two of our BEPP meetings to bring all faculty up-to-date on new TracDat procedures and policies and give them a refresher on current practices. In addition, we invited Karen Wong to speak at our BEPP meeting to give faculty and staff the opportunity to get additional clarification on SLOAC.

3. **Supported Faculty Development.** Faculty participated in Canvas Training cohorts to aid in the migration of our new LMS. In addition, faculty presented at the BEPP Division meetings best practices for developing their Canvas course shells. Any faculty not trained in Canvas are strongly encouraged to do.

4. **Participated and Supported the Skyline College Promise Initiative.** With the assistance of the Dean, faculty reviewed current courses and certificates to see how they aligned the Skyline College Promise priorities of guided pathways, strong workforce, college redesign and equity and cultural competence. We deleted courses that were not current or tied to industry, we revised courses to meet industry standards. We revised certificates and we reviewed labor market data for emerging career pathways and as a result we

are in the planning stages of creating new certificates in Human Resources Management.

5. **Increase Course and Fully Online Certificates and faculty preparation for distance education.** The objectives for this goal are to increase the number of online courses and develop fully online certificates. Also, to support faculty with Canvas online training and certification, and support to attend CTTL workshops to enhance teaching and learning and student success. 98% of our courses are approved for Distance Education. The department is in support of the Skyline NOW initiative.

II.A.2   Progress on Program Student Learning Outcomes
Describe the progress made on PSLOs including achievements, gaps in learning, and/or areas in which further effort is needed.
Upload the TracDat report to the SPOL document repository in the Program Review folder for the current academic year (Program Uploads). Make sure the file name includes the program name or abbreviation (e.g., PRIE-TracDat 2017).

Narrative
SLO's and PSLO's for the Business Programs were assessed in core courses during the 2016-2019   assessment cycle. The Business PSLOs are listed below:

Accounting/Financial Accounting - Understand and apply accounting principles to prepare financial statements.
Business Law - Develop an understanding of the law and the legal environment as it relates to business operations, including its ethical implications.
Intro to Business Information Systems - Identify the basics of information technology and apply software applications to enhance efficiency of business functions.
Business Communications - Create effective oral and written business communications utilizing modern communication technologies.
Economics/Macroeconomics - Demonstrate knowledge of basic economic concepts and how they affect business.
Critical Thinking - Apply critical thinking and analytical skills in decision making and problem solving.

Core Courses Assessed:
BUS. 103 – Intro to Business Information Systems. Using software applications on a final project analyzing and finding solutions to a business problem. 89% of students scored higher than 70%.
BUS. 120 – Mathematical Analysis for Business. Assessment midterm with probability problems construct and interpret discrete probability distributions. Students met criteria with 76% of students scoring 70% or higher.
BUS. 123 Statistics – Computing calculations for loan payments and amortization schedules. Survey administered, 81% of students indicated they knew how to solve for present value and future value calculations and loan payments. On the Finance Exam 50% of students met the success criteria. Have students use the TI calculator for complex finance functions instead of manual calculations to resolve so many mistakes. Action, Use new or revised teaching methods and give more time for practice finance problems, regular quizzes and comprehensive practice exam.
BUS 123 – Statistics –Test problems online and face to face. Organize and interpret data using frequency distributions and graphs. Criterion was met. 70% of online students successfully met the criterion while only 50% of classroom students did. Online students have access to all their notes and the textbook during exams. Use new or revised teaching methods.
BUS. 150 - Entrepreneurship-Small Business Management. Analyze and evaluate the appropriateness of entering a small business venture. Students completed a - assignment.
BUS. 401 - Business Communications

Writing Assignments:
- Summarize results of an Internal Customer Service Survey to employees, 96% met criteria.
- Summarize the most important point of 5 Steps to Help You Engage Your Audience to the manager of your company's communications department. 100% of students met criteria.
- Presentation (3 minute) on Social Media Communication. 100% of students passed.

Summary of PSLO Assessment and Action Plans:
All core courses have PSLO's, assessment methods and assessment results. Attached is the 4-Column report. Based on the data from assessment results all of the core course assessments included critical thinking and analytical skills in decision making and problem solving. It is apparent that critical thinking is a main emphasis for Business majors and embedded in course SLOs and PSLOs.

The Business faculty are working on pedagogical gaps to continue to improve success and retention rates. Action items identified were to use new or revised teaching methods such as group work, flipped classroom model, design thinking (Case Method-resolving real-life cases), and project based learning to enhance student success and engagement. Also, develop revised assessment plans for core classes incorporating more project based assignments, rather than only using exams for assessment.

Based on PSLO program needs, we want to re-imagine a dedicated classroom space (8306) in order to align with industry standards, pedagogy, environment and varying learning styles. The classroom design has not changed in well over 50 years, however, our pedagogy is constantly changing to meet the needs of industry standards. We are requesting one classroom dedicated to 21st century learning and teaching. This classroom will promote critical thinking, project based learning, teamwork, collaboration and innovation. These are all essential skills to the business world. The room design would include round tables with electrical outlets, white board paint, accent walls, chairs, and Apple TV. These goals align with the Skyline College Strategic Priorities for Facilities and Technology, Equity and Excellence and Instruction. The Business faculty would like to reevaluate the PSLO's based on assessment results.

Evidentiary Documents
PRIE-TracDat 2019.pdf

II.A.3.a Program Personnel

Describe the current staffing structure of the program and how it aligns with achieving the purpose of the program.

Narrative

Currently, the Business Department has two full-time faculty and five adjunct faculty. The business department is in need of one more full-time faculty position to replace three previous full-time faculty positions in order to achieve the goals of our program. Redesigning curriculum, development of new certificates in Human Resource Management, Business faculty participating in the NOW program teaching a cohort of students in Business Administration AS-T Degree fully online.

II.A.3.b   Personnel FTE

Provide the current FTE of each category of personnel.

- FT Faculty FTE:
- Adjunct Faculty FTE:
- Classified Staff FTE:
- Administrator FTE:

Narrative

Position	Staffing Levels
	2018-2019
Administration 1.0 Dean	1.0 FTE 1.0
Classified Staff FT 1.0 BEPP Division Assistant	1.0 FTE 1.0
FTE Faculty Full-Time Business-Guillermo Ortiz 80% phased retirement Business- Hui Pate Business-Soledad McCarthy	3.79 0.80 1.4 1.588
FTE Faculty Part-Time (5)	.712
Total Full Time Equivalent Staff	6.50

Administration position staffed by the Division Dean, Christine Roumbanis
Classified Staff FT: BEPP: 1 BEPP Division Assistant
Student Workers: 2 student workers in the BEPP Division to assist with general office work and assist with Division work. Federally funded – Work study.
FTE Faculty Full-Time: Guillermo Ortiz (Business/Accounting) is on phased retirement at 80% for 2018-19.
FTE faculty Part-Time: 5 Part-Time Instructors, .712 FTE
Faculty Reassigned Time .20 FTE:
-- Soledad McCarthy, Accreditation
-- BUS Coordinator   5 hrs/wk overload

II.A.4   **Program Access**

Describe matters of access relevant to your program such as offering patterns, service hours, F2F vs. DE offerings, availability of services to online students, on-campus vs. off-campus locations, unaddressed needs, and/or highly effective practices.

Narrative

The Business Department is committed to Meta-Majors, offering meaningful certificates and regularly evaluates course offerings to ensure accurate patterns. During this review, 98% of classes were updated and/or reviewed for Distance Education status. The department is participating in the NOW program as we understand the need for reentry students to be able to access offerings online or at night.

II.A.5   **Program Environment**
Describe key factors and changes impacting the program such as college initiatives, industry needs, regulatory changes, state mandates, grant requirements, personnel changes, demand for classes/services, and other issues.

Narrative
College Initiatives

The Business Department is in full support of Meta-Majors and Guided pathways. Faculty are in the process of revising and creating certificates and AS degree with Meta Majors in mind

The Business Department is participating in the Skyline NOW initiative. This program will support our working adults with offering during nights, weekends and online. 98% of the courses in the business department are distance ed. approved.

Industry Needs

Business degrees and certificates can lead to lucrative career pathways. A new Human Resources certificate is being created ans well as a Retail Sales and Marketing Certificate to meet the needs of the industry.

Personnel Changes

The Business Department currently has 2 full-time faculty

We have one instructor on 80% phase retirement

Our dean of BEPP is retiring

II.A.6   Program Equity

Based on the data reviewed, highlight any progress and/or effective practices employed in the program to address identified student equity gaps and minimize disproportionate impact. Describe any pre-existing or anticipate program barriers in making progress. If you intend to request resources for objectives related to equity, explain any connections between barriers described and the support/resource(s) requested.

Narrative

Upon analysis of data, there are two equity issues affecting the Business Department

The first is the under-enrollment of female students (44.2% business students) versus males students (53.4%) this is in relation to the overall College make-up of 52.3% female students and 44.9% male students. We know there is a gender gap in the finance and banking industry. Entrepreneurship helps even this disparity with women-owned firms accounting for 51% of small businesses (https://www.nawbo.org/resources/women-business-owner-statistics).

We are experiencing a steady decline in the number of Black-non-Hispanic students since 2013-2014. The Business Department was at 6.5% (significantly higher than the College rate of 3.6%). During 2017-2018, the department was at a low of 3.4% (still greater than the College average of 2.9%). Hispanic/Latino students were at 14.5% for the Business Department relative to the College average of %18.3 percent.

There are a few hypotheses for this data. First, Black, Latino/Hispanic professors are not widely represented in the Business Department. Students who see instructors like themselves are able to imagine careers not historically available to them.

Business courses do not generally include supplemental instructors and there is only 1 Business/Accounting tutor in the Learning Commons who graduated during 2017-2018.

Business courses are taught in classrooms that do not mirror or foster a creative or entrepreneurial mindset. A transformative teaching space would ignite student participation and creativity. Creating alternative assessments to scantrons is in line with new pedagogy. The hiring of an additional full-time faculty would allow the department to offer more courses at convenient student times.

III.A.   Curriculum Review

There are four steps to program review of curriculum:

1. Request your program's Course Offering Report from PRIE. Based on that report, take action to bank, delete, and/or reactivate courses. PLEASE SEE THE CPR WEBSITE (DIRECTIONS AND FORMS) FOR DETAILED INSTRUCTIONS. http://www.skylinecollege.edu/programreview/cpr.php

2. Review and update all course outlines on CurricUNET. PLEASE SEE THE CPR WEBSITE (DIRECTIONS AND FORMS) FOR DETAILED INSTRUCTIONS. http://www.skylinecollege.edu/programreview/cpr.php

3. Complete the Course Outline and Prerequisite Checklist Table. Upload the file to the SPOL document repository in the Program Review folder for the current academic year (Program Uploads).

4. Verify and document the two-year cycle of curriculum offering to ensure that students have access to courses necessary to complete certificates, degrees, and transfer in a timely manner. Review the sequencing of prerequisites.

Narrative
Completed

Evidentiary Documents
CourseOutlinePrereqChecklist (Update 2)-page 2.pdf
CourseOutlinePrereqChecklist (Update)-page 1.pdf

IV.A.1 Considering Key Findings

Considering the results of CPR assessment, identify program strengths, challenges, opportunities, concerns, and areas in which further research is needed. Describe how the key findings can be used to improve program effectiveness in order to promote student learning and achievement.

Narrative
Strengths:
- Pending creation of Human Resources Management Certificate and Sales and Marketing Certificate
- Participating in the Skyline NOW initiative
- Highly experienced division assistant

Challenges:
- 2 full-time faculty and 5 adjunct instructors are not sufficient for the number of courses needed.
- Classroom layout are outdated and are not conducive to a transformative, creative learning experience.

Opportunities:
- Skyline NOW initiative will recruit returning working students
- Collaborations with industry professionals

Concerns:
- Need for more Canvas training offerings
- Low adjunct pool

IV.A.2   Aspirations

The key findings and program aspirations will be used as the foundation to build a strategy for program enhancement.

- What is the ideal future of the program?
- What long-term results does the program want to achieve?
- How do the key findings prompt or inform the program's aspirations?

Narrative

Our aspirations are to

- Increase enrollment in courses

- Create and revise meaningful certificates that align with the Skyline College Promise and Industry Standards

- Increase student success rates especially in online courses

- To continue to improve our pedagogy and equity professional development.

- Increase faculty

- Create a transformative classroom for business/entrepreneurial students

V.A.   **Program Strategy**

Based on the key findings and aspirations, develop a plan designed to enhance the quality of the program. Describe the strategy (or strategies) to be implemented over the next six years. Strategies could include intended changes or areas of inquiry to pursue.

[NOTE: In the next item, objectives will be created with action steps and resource requests to support each strategy identified here. Each objective will also be tied to an Institutional Goal.]

Narrative

Strategic Goal #1-Student Completion
- The Business Department is committed to the comprehensive redesign of our degrees and certificates.
- Fall 2019 launching BUS 162-Money Talks-A comprehensive financial literacy course that is an AS-T GE for Quantitative Reasoning

Strategic Goal #2-Transformative Teaching and Learning
- The Business Department is committed to providing students a transformative teaching space
- The Business Department is committed to providing online certificates and degrees
- The Business Department is committed to offering alternative assessments
- The Business Department has course offering for the CIPHER Learning Community and would like to participate in more learning communities.
- Collaborate with Bay Area Entrepreneur Center and Business Expo Week (A week long entrepreneurial conference aimed at student entrepreneurs).
- Collaborate the CDLC to create a Pre-K-12 bridge to entrepreneurship
- High impact culturally relevant classes
- Commitment to zero cost text books

Strategic Goal #3-Technology and Facilities-
- A 21st century, transformative teaching space would foster student engagement and creativity
- A SMART classroom
- The Business Department will launch 8-306 as a contemporary learning space designed to engage students in ways to reflect collaborative work spaces and integrate the New World of Work.
- To create an online supplemental instruction component

Strategic Goal #4-Internationalized Campus Community-
- Fall 2019 launching BUS 162-Money Talks-A comprehensive financial literacy course that is an AS-T GE for Quantitative Reasoning
- Fall 2019 launching Ethnic and Multicultural Marketing
- Fall 2019 launching Managing Culture and Diversity Human Resources Course

Strategic Goal #5-Strong and Effective Community Partnerships
- Dual Enrollment courses taught at Mills High School at night

- Entrepreneurship courses taught at Baden High School
- Collaboration with Middle College to present Middle College Market Day
- Business faculty are actively involved with the Grove Scholarship process

Strategic Goal #6-Fiscal Stability
- The Business Department is assessing the day and time of business offerings to ensure efficient and cost effective offerings
- Program partnerships with other divisions and programs to create events and opportunities for students

Strategic Goal #7-Professional Recruitment and Retention
- The Business Department will commit to sending adjuncts to the Adjunct Symposium
- The Business Department is committed to Meta-Majors and Guided Pathways
- Commitment to professional development for all faculty

V.B.   **Action Plan and Resources Requests**

Develop one of more measurable objectives (goals) to begin in the next year. Each objective will include action steps and any related resource requests. No narrative response will be entered in this section, but the objectives you create will be printed automatically in the CPR report under this item.

1. To begin, click on PLANNING at the top of the page, then CREATE A NEW OBJECTIVE. To view previously created objectives, click PLANNING at the top of the page, then VIEW MY OBJECTIVE.
2. IMPORTANT! Make sure to associate each objective to this standard in the CPR and link each objective to one or more Institutional Goals. Need help? Contact the PRIE Office for further instructions.

Narrative
Please see planning objectives

Associated Objectives
740-BEPP PSC
723-Create a transformative teaching space
732-Faculty Canvas Training
731-Hire 1 full-time faculty
736-Zero Text Book Initiative